

ASHLAND HISTORIC COMMISSION
Meeting Minutes

June 7, 2017

Community Development/Engineering Services Building – 51 Winburn Way – Siskiyou Room

CALL TO ORDER:

Commission Chair, Shostrom called the meeting to order at 6:06pm in the Siskiyou Room at the Community Development and Engineering Offices located at 51 Winburn Way, Ashland OR 97520.

Commissioners Present:	Council Liaison:
Skibby	Rich Rosenthal-ABSENT
Emery	Staff Present:
Shostrom	Maria Harris; Planning Dept.
Swink	Regan Trapp; Secretary
Von Chamier	
Whitford	
Giordano	
Commissioners Absent:	Leonard (E)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Whitford motioned to approve minutes from May 3, 2017. Swink seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed.

PUBLIC FORUM:

Peter Kreisman, homeowner of 672 Monroe Street, Ashland, OR, addressed the Commission. Mr. Kreisman has lived in the area for many years and on a visit to the Ashland Airport, discovered the Lithia Springs Bridge in some brush out past the runway. They would like it to be recovered by the City and have it moved to a place where it can be resurrected. He showed the Commission photos of the old bridge and suggested that maybe it could be moved to Neil Creek but is open to other ideas as well. Mr. Kreisman plans on attending the Transportation Commission meeting to see if there is interest from them as well. Harris suggested that he talk to the Parks Department to see if the bridge could be used on a trail since trails are always being developed. Mr. Kreisman stated that the bridge is in two sections so it could be moved on a flatbed. Shostrom stated that the Historic Commission is supportive of resurrection of the bridge and will do anything to help this process move along.

COUNCIL LIAISON REPORT:

Rosenthal was not in attendance to give the report.

PLANNING ACTION REVIEW:

PLANNING ACTION: PA-2017-00707

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 550 East Main Street

OWNER: Geoff & Mary Ann Geness

APPLICANT: Kistler, Small and White, Architects

DESCRIPTION: A request for Site Design Review and Conditional Use Permit approval for the property located at 550 East Main Street. The proposal involves a two-story, 960-square foot detached addition to accommodate two additional hotel units, bringing the total approved hotel units on the property to four. The application includes a request for an Exception to the Site Development & Design Standards to not provide the typically required five-foot landscape buffer at the property line adjacent to the city's Fire Station #1. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** Commercial; **ZONING:** C-1; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 09AC; **TAX LOT:** #14900.

Both Skibby and Shostrom stated that they spoke with the applicant on several occasions but that those meetings would not affect their decisions on this project.

Harris gave the staff report for PA-2017-00707.

The applicants were not present for the public hearing.

Shostrom closed the public hearing and opened to the Commission for comments.

The Historic Commission greatly appreciates the retention and rehabilitation of the original home that is currently underway including the use of historically compatible exterior materials such as the siding and windows. The additions and decks at the back of the home cascade nicely down from the main form.

The Commission also appreciates that the proposed new structure includes architectural elements and materials of the historic home such as the bay windows and matching wood windows. The Commission believes the proposed structure meets many of the Historic District Design Standards in 18.4.2.050.B. However, there are several standards that the Commission determined were not met by the proposed structure. The Commission recommends approval of the application with a condition that the plans are revised to address the following standards

Shostrom motioned to approve PA-2017-00707 with below recommendations. Whitford seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed.

Height, Scale, Massing, Form (AMC 18.4.2.050.B 2, 3, 4, 9)

The Historic Commission appreciates the change from the initial concept of a flat roof with a deck to a roof shape that is consistent with the historic buildings in the immediate vicinity. The Commission's concern is that the proposed structure exceeds the height of the original home and will be clearly visible from E. Main and Siskiyou Blvd. As a result, the height, massing and form varies with historic buildings in the vicinity. Despite the small size of the proposed new building, the roof will be prominent in part because of the topography of the site. The Commission recommends using a hipped roof (pyramid) and also consider using false dormers with vents.

Rhythm of Openings (AMC 18.4.2.050.B.7)

The Historic Commission has a concern about the consistency of the pattern and rhythm of the wall to door/windows openings on the west elevation (side view 2) with the historic home.

- Doors on first and second floor – the type and width of doors is not typically found in the historic district. The Commission recommends using narrower French doors (e.g., four feet wide) or a series of double hung windows.
- Bay windows – the window and side panels appear slightly out of proportion. The Commission recommends using a wider window and narrower side panels to reflect the bay window on the historic home.

PLANNING ACTION: PA-2017-00838

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 250 Alta Ave.

APPLICANT/OWNER: Vadim Agakhanov

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Physical & Environmental Constraints Review Permit to construct a new single-family dwelling on Severe Constraint Hillside Lands for the property located at 250 Alta Ave. The proposal involves an Exception to the Development Standards for Hillside Lands to allow for a 10' tall retaining wall to stabilize an existing nine-foot tall un-retained cut slope, and an Exception to the Street Design Standards to retain Alta Ave. as an unimproved street with the addition of a curb and gutter, but no paving or sidewalk installation. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** Single-Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-1-7.5; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 05DC; **TAX LOT:** 1301.

There was no ex-parte contact or conflict of interest indicated by the Commission.

Harris gave the staff report for PA-2017-00838.

Shostrom opened the public hearing to the applicants.

Kim Locklin, property owner of 250 Alta Ave, Ashland, OR, addressed the Commission regarding the project. Ms. Locklin stated that this is a request for a physical and environmental constraints review permit for the construction of a new single family residence on land that has more than a 25 percent slope. The request also includes a tree removal permit to remove two six-inch DBH pear trees.

Shostrom closed the public hearing and opened to the Commission for comments.

After a brief discussion regarding width of street, and parking issues the Commission rendered their decision.

Giordano motioned to approve PA-2017-00838 as presented. Swink seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed.

PLANNING ACTION: PA-2017-00969

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 244 Hargadine Street

OWNER/APPLICANT: Elisa Fox/Tim Plankenhorn

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Site Design Review and Conditional Use Permit approval to operate a two-unit Accessory Traveler's Accommodation including one detached guest unit and one owner's unit in the existing home for the property located at 244 Hargadine Street. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** Low Density, Multi-Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-2; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 09BD; **TAX LOT #:** 16500.

There was no ex-parte contact or conflict of interest indicated by the Commission.

Harris gave the staff report for PA-2017-00969.

The applicants were not present for the public hearing.

Shostrom closed the public hearing and opened to the Commission for comments.

The Historic Commission does not recommend approval of the application because it does not meet the following Historic District Design Standards in Ashland Municipal Code (AMC) 18.4.2.050.

Shostrom motioned deny to PA-2017-00969. Von Chamier seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed.

Height, Scale, Massing, Form (AMC 18.4.2.050.B 2, 3, 4, 9)

The vertical volume is not consistent and is out of scale with the historic home on the property as well as other historic buildings in the vicinity. Consider a hipped roof.

Rhythm of Openings (AMC 18.4.2.050.B.7)

The pattern and rhythm of window/door openings on the proposed building is inconsistent with the historic home as well as adjacent historic buildings in the vicinity. Windows should be compatible in proportion, shape and size to the historic home and historic buildings in the vicinity.

- The modern gable-end windows on the front elevation are not historically compatible. Consider historically proportioned double-hung windows over garage man door.
- Proposed balcony is not proportionate to front elevation in that it is too deep and too narrow. Recommend balcony be positioned and sized symmetrical to the garage door.
- Proposed balcony door is not compatible in type or proportion. Consider smaller door with windows or French door.
- Recommend carriage-style garage door.

- A historic building would have windows on the sides and back of building that are historically proportioned and have a rhythm.

Building Materials (AMC) 18.4.2.050.C

The Commission recommends the following exterior building materials to maintain the historic and architectural character of the district.

- Siding should have a six-inch exposure or less and be smooth finish.
- Use corner board and belly board at deck level.
- Use historic window and door trim (minimum of 3 ½ inches wide).

COMMISSION ITEMS NOT ON AGENDA:

There were no items to discuss.

NEW ITEMS:

- Review board schedule.
- Project assignments for planning actions

OLD BUSINESS:

The decision by the Planning Commission regarding 165 Water was discussed.

Review Board Schedule

June 8 th	Terry, Sam, Bill
June 15 th	Terry, Piper, Keith
June 22 nd	Terry, Tom, Sam
June 29 th	Terry, Dale, Taylor
July 6 th	Terry, Keith, Piper

PA-2014-00710	143 Nutley	Swink & Whitford
PA-2014-02206	485 A Street	Whitford
PA-2015-00878	35 S. Pioneer	Leonard
PA-2015-01695	399 Beach	Skibby
PA-2016-00847	252 B Street	Whitford
PA-2016-01027	276 B Street	Shostrom & Leonard
PA-2016-02103	133 Alida	Swink
PA-2016-02095	563 Rock St.	Whitford
PA-2016-02114	556 B	Von Chamier
PA-2017-00013	15, 35, 44 & 51 S. Pioneer Street	ALL
PA-2017-00235	114 Granite	Leonard
PA-2017-00325	746 C Street	Von Chamier
PA-2017-00200	165 Water	ALL
PA-2017-00707	550 E. Main	No one assigned
PA-2017-00838	250 Alta Ave	No one assigned

ANNOUNCEMENTS & INFORMATIONAL ITEMS:

Next meeting is scheduled July 5, 2017 at 6:00 pm

There being no other items to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:15pm

Respectfully submitted by Regan Trapp