

**ASHLAND CITY COUNCIL  
BUSINESS MEETING  
MINUTES  
June 6, 2023**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Mayor Tonya Graham called the meeting to order at 6:03 p.m.

**1. Land Acknowledgement**

Councilor Hansen read the land acknowledgement.

**II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Mayor Graham led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**III. ROLL CALL**

Mayor Graham, Councilor Hyatt, Bloom, Dahle, Kaplan, DuQuenne and Hansen were present.

**IV. MAYOR'S/CHAIR OF THE COUNCIL ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Mayor Graham commented on the lightning strike fire that occurred in the watershed the day before. The city was taking nominations for the James C. Ragland Award. There would be no more fuel reduction burns for the next several months.

**1. Juneteenth National Independence Day Proclamation**

Mayor Graham read the proclamation. Councilor DuQuenne noted events celebrating Juneteenth would happen Thursday, June 15, 2023, at 11:00 at SOU and June 17, 2023, at Pear Blossom Park in Medford. She expressed her appreciation for the proclamation. She explained she did not pledge to the flag because her ancestors had died for the flag, nor did she say "...with liberty and justice for all." She would say those words when there was liberty and justice for all.

**2. Proclamation Celebrating National Pollinator Week**

Mayor Graham read the proclamation.

**Kate Jackson/Ashland/**Spoke about the Bee City Committee and announced a self-guided garden tour June 25, 2023, from 9:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m. of ten gardens.

**V. APPROVAL OF CITY COUNCIL MINUTES**

- 1. Minutes of the June 14, 2022, Business Meeting**
- 2. Minutes of the May 24, 2022, Special Business Meeting**
- 3. Minutes of the May 15, 2023, Study Session**
- 4. Minutes of the May 16, 2023, Business Meeting**

## **5. Minutes of the May 25, 2023, Special Study Session**

Councilor Kaplan made a correction to the May 16, 2023, Business Meeting. Page 6, third paragraph, the fourth sentence was changed to read, **“He was not prepared to support a policy that kept a minimum fund balance at those high levels for those funds without seeing a much clearer justification for doing so.”**

**Councilor Kaplan/Bloom m/s to approve the minutes of June 14, 2022, Business Meeting, the May 24, 2022, Special Business Meeting, the May 15, 2023, Study Session, the May 25, 2023, Special Study Session as presented, and the minutes of May 16, 2023, as amended.**

**Roll Call Vote: Councilor Kaplan, DuQuenne, Dahle, Bloom, Hyatt, and Hansen, YES. Motion passed.**

## **VI. SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS & AWARDS**

### **1. Don Bieghler, City Band Director Recognition**

Former city councilor Stephen Jensen honored Bon Bieghler who has directed the Ashland City band for sixty years. Mayor Graham presented the James M. Ragland award to the Ashland City Band. Mayor Graham then honored Mr. Bieghler with a plaque recognizing his tremendous contribution. Mr. Bieghler thanked the council and citizens for supporting the band. He passed the baton to the new band director, Christi Lundahl.

### **2. Climate and Environment Policy Advisory Committee (CEPAC): Greenhouse Gas Emissions Recommendations**

City Manager Joe Lessard introduced the topic. This will be an item on a future agenda based on council direction. Climate and Energy Analyst Chad Woodward introduced Brian Sohl, the CEPAC chair and Student Representative Kiera Retiz. Chair Sohl provided background and a presentation included in the packet:

- CEAP Goal #1: REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS!
- How are We Doing? POORLY!
- Methane is the SECOND Most Important GHG
- Health Impacts of Methane Exposure
- How did we get here?
- What is the Ask of Council?
- Timeline
- Where Do Ashland Emissions Come From?

Ms. Retiz spoke to how climate change was degrading the environment quickly. Chair Sohl explained the initial intention was reducing fossil fuel in new commercial building and now they wanted a ban on new residential with an ordinance and study in changing greenhouse gas emission for residential remodels and new construction.

**Piper Banks/Ashland/**Spoke to the weight that climate change placed on her future and others. She supported passing an electrification and clean air ordinance.

**Noel Chatroux/Ashland/**Explained stopping construction of new buildings that use methane was a minimum and encouraged council to move forward on an ordinance.

Council shared their support and concerns regarding the ordinance. It was a complex issue that needed to involve stakeholders and community. It also needed to be enforced correctly. Staff would work with the Legal Division.

## **VII. CITY MANAGER REPORT**

City Manager Joe Lessard provided the manager's report. Council would review the telecommunications draft ordinance at their July 17, 2023, study session.

## **VIII. PUBLIC FORUM**

**Leda Shapiro/Ashland/**Read from a document submitted into the record (see attached).

**Kelly Marcotulli/Ashland/**Spoke about radio frequency, social media dangers and the need to take 5G seriously.

**Miriam Reed/Ashland/**Spoke against 5G cell towers.

**Paul Sheldon/Ashland/**Supported hiring Mr. Campanelli to write a restrictive telecommunications ordinance.

**Pamala Joy/Ashland/**Shared her personal experience with electromagnetic issues.

**Angie Thusius/Ashland/** Supported hiring Mr. Campanelli and spoke to EMF radiation.

## **IX. CONSENT AGENDA**

- 1. City Attorney Profile and Recruitment Process**
- 2. Liquor License Approval for BP Products North America (DBA ARCO AM-PM) at 2380 Highway 66**
- 3. Planning Commission Appointments**
- 4. Climate and Environment Policy Advisory Committee Appointment**
- 5. Public Arts Committee Appointment**

**Councilor Hyatt/Hansen m/s to approve the Consent Agenda. Roll Call Vote: Councilor Hyatt, Hansen, Dahle, DuQuenne, Bloom, and Kaplan, YES. Motion passed.**

## **X. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

- 1. Public Hearing for the BN 2023-2025 Budget and Property Tax Levy**
  - a. Resolution 2023-10 Adopting BN 2023-2025 Budget and Appropriations
  - b. Resolution 2023-11 Certifying City of Ashland Services

- c. Resolution 2023-12 Declaring the City's Election to Receive State Revenues
- d. Resolution 2023-13 Levying Property Taxes for the Fiscal Year July 1, 2023, through June 30, 2024
- e. Resolutions 2023-15 Allocating Transit Lodging Tax proceeds to Travel Ashland

Finance Director Marianne Berry presented the 2023-25 biennium budget approved by the Citizens' Budget Committee and the summary of changes (see attached).

- Summary of Changes

**Mayor Graham opened the public hearing at 7:38 p.m.**

**Mayor Graham closed the public hearing at 7:38 p.m.**

**Councilor Bloom/DuQuenne m/s to postpone the approval of the 2023-2025 biennial budget to the following council business meeting on June 20, 2023 and request a special study session to discuss it further. DISCUSSION:**

Councilor Bloom's understanding was a meeting to discuss the budget would happen prior to approving the budget. There were policy issues that council could not discuss in the Citizen's Budget Committee (CBC) that council could take up. There were funded and underfunded initiatives council should look into. It would be more prudent to take the time in a study session to further discuss and adjust items if needed then pass the budget June 20, 2023. Councilor DuQuenne agreed. She wanted the opportunity to discuss it further. There was not lot of discussion during the last budget. She wanted to make sure the decisions being made were in accordance with community.

Mayor Graham asked for clarification on the significance of June 20, 2023. Mr. Lessard explained it was on the LookAhead for two meetings because budgets are usually adopted by ordinance. However, Oregon state allowed budgets to be adopted as a resolution.

Councilor Hyatt asked if council made changes to the budget that met certain criteria, would they have to reconvene the CBC and bring it back to council. Ms. Berry responded if there was a 10% increase, they would have to republish the LBI. Finance Systems Manager Bryn Morrison further explained it would be republished 5-30 days prior to the public hearing. The CBC would not have to reconvene, but it would require a special meeting. They had to have everything done by June 30, 2023 if council changed the fund more than 10%.

Councilor Bloom clarified it was not his intention of adding money to the budget. He wanted council to review some items in the budget, policies and priorities and possibly move small amounts to meet goals like firefighting and childcare.

Councilor Hansen explained this was his first budget process and noted there had been five budget meetings and did not understand why council would want to draw it out further.

Council Bloom responded it was clear with the guidelines and mandates of the CBC, they could not discuss policy and he wanted an opportunity to discuss it.

Councilor Dahle asked staff if there were other logistical issues in delaying approving the budget. Ms. Berry thought the council should take the time it needed but knowing what it took to get from the approved budget to this point, it was a heavy lift. Making changes to the final budget when it had to be published by June 30, 2023 would be a burden on staff to ensure what was published was accurate and complete.

Councilor Kaplan noted policies were approved by council prior to going into the process. There was also a process to make adjustments to the budget moving forward into the biennium. He suggested adjusting the budget as they encountered policy changes. Ms. Berry added there will be an opportunity to do a budget supplemental because the city will receive and be awarded grant monies. Mr. Lessard further added there were budget supplementals every quarter so there would be opportunities to adjust the budget. Councilor Hyatt asked if there might be challenges receiving monies from the state. Ms. Morrison responded there was not. The city needed to certify to the county by July 15, 2023, but the whole budget needed to be wrapped up by June 30, 2023. Councilor DuQuenne understood the supplemental budget process but preferred delaying the process for a thorough review. Mayor Graham commented there was time to discuss it during this meeting and there had been time to discuss it during the CBC meetings. She recommended voting on the motion. **Roll Call Vote: Councilor DuQuenne, Bloom, and Dahle, YES; Councilor Kaplan, Hyatt, and Hansen, NO. Mayor Graham broke the tie with a NO vote. Motion passed 4-3.**

Councilor Hyatt suggested a further discussion July 5, 2023.

**Councilor Hyatt/Kaplan m/s to call a special business meeting on July 5, 2023, to have a conversation of budget priorities with the ability to direct staff with a supplemental budget should it be necessary. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Hyatt thought there were good points on both sides. She recognized that Oregon budget law had certain requirements for staff and this process had gone through five CBC meetings. There were some policy questions brought up that were not addressed or discussed. Councilor Kaplan concurred. Councilor Hansen commented there was time this evening to have policy discussion. Councilor Hyatt thought the July 5, 2023 meeting would let council have the conversation around policy and make supplemental budget changes as necessary. Councilor Hansen clarified they would discuss amendments this evening and come back and meet on July 5, 2023 for policy decisions they were unable to have during the CBC meetings.

Mr. Lessard clarified the chamber was scheduled July 5, 2023, for the Parks Commission meeting. He suggested moving the budget policy discussion to a regularly scheduled meeting with council providing him with their questions or issues. He recommended having

the study session July 17, 2023 for discussion with council taking action if needed during the July 18, 2023 business meeting.

Councilor Hyatt withdrew motion with Councilor Kaplan's agreement. Council agreed to move the discussion to the July 17th and 18th meetings.

### **Council Deliberation and Decision**

Public Hearing for the BN 2023-2025 Budget and Property Tax Levy

a. Resolution 2023-10 Adopting BN 2023-2025 Budget and Appropriations

**Councilor Dahle/Kaplan m/s to approve Resolution 2023-10 a resolution to adopt Adopting BN 2023-2025 Budget and appropriate such amounts as necessary to implement the 2023-2025 budget. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Dahle commented it was his first budget and appreciated Councilor Hyatt working through it with council. He was aware of the time and effort from staff. He wanted a mindful discussion and then to move forward. Councilor Kaplan supported the motion and looked forward to the discussions. Councilor Bloom appreciated the alternative. He would not make amendments to the budget now, but there were items severely underfunded. He would support the budget. Councilor Hansen appreciated Councilor Bloom's comments. It was not perfect and supplemental changes were part of the job. Councilor DuQuenne understood the work that went into this but would not support the motion. Mayor Graham explained this was her third budget. She observed the last budget was during the pandemic and appreciated that there was time to delve deeper and asked questions. She was also pleased by the direction this conversation was going. She was not comfortable breaking a tie vote. Councilor Hyatt thanked staff and noted the effort and time preparing the budget and going through the approval process. **Roll Call Vote: Councilor Kaplan, Hansen, Hyatt, Dahle, and Bloom, YES; Councilor DuQuenne, NO. Motion passed 5-1.**

Mayor Graham wanted a new process that the meeting following the last budget meeting included a deeper policy conversation and having the meeting after that be the adoption of the budget. Councilor Kaplan suggested starting the process earlier, in April instead of May.

Mr. Lessard would email council for their comments and issues with a response deadline of two weeks. Mayor Graham thanked the CBC members for their participation in the process.

**b. Resolution 2023-11 Certifying City of Ashland Services**

**Councilor Hyatt/Bloom m/s to approve the following resolution titled Resolution 2023-11, a resolution certifying City of Ashland services. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Hyatt explained this was necessary to certify municipal services and was critical to receiving state funds and defined subventions. Councilor Bloom agreed. **Roll Call Vote: Councilor Kaplan, Hyatt, Bloom, Dahle, Hansen, and DuQuenne, YES. Motion passed.**

- c. Resolution 2023-12 Declaring the City's Election to Receive State Revenues

**Councilor Bloom/Hansen m/s to approve the following resolution, Resolution 2023-12 declaring the City's election to receive state revenues. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Bloom supported receiving revenues from the state. Councilor Hansen added this option allowed the city to receive tax money from liquor and cannabis. **Roll Call Vote: Councilor Dahle, Hyatt, Hansen, Kaplan, Bloom, and DuQuenne, YES. Motion passed.**

- d. Resolution 2023-13 Levying Property Taxes for the Fiscal Year July 1, 2023, through June 30, 2024

**Councilor Hyatt/Dahle m/s to approve the following resolution titled Resolution 2023-13 a resolution to levy property taxes for the Fiscal Year July 1, 2023, through June 30, 2024. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Hyatt explained if council chose to do differently from the CBC, staff would have to republish. This was also the second part of receiving state funds to provide levels of service council has committed to. Councilor Dahle agreed. Councilor Kaplan noted this was passed by the CBC unanimously. Councilor DuQuenne confirmed it would not raise taxes for citizens. Councilor Hansen added that this was the highest tax rate, it was at its maximum and could not be raised. **Roll Call Vote: Councilor Bloom, Hansen, DuQuenne, Hyatt, Kaplan, and Dahle, YES. Motion passed.**

- e. Resolutions 2023-15 Allocating Transit Lodging Tax proceeds to Travel Ashland

**Councilor Hansen/DuQuenne m/s to approve Resolution 2023-15, a resolution to approve allocation of Transit Lodging Tax proceeds to Travel Ashland. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Hansen explained this was the tax money that Travel Ashland used to do so much work for the region. It provided money for many services. He thought both the Chamber and Travel Ashland were doing great work. Councilor DuQuenne reaffirmed the tax went to Travel Ashland and noted Travel Ashland had done a great job making Ashland known. Councilor Hyatt supported the motion. Travel Ashland was a key partner and she looked forward to working together. **Roll Call Vote: Councilor Bloom, Hansen, Kaplan, DuQuenne, Dahle and Hyatt, YES. Motion passed.**

## **2. Resolution 2023-14 Adopting Miscellaneous Fees and Charges for Fiscal Year July 1, 2023, through June 30, 2024**

Finance Director Marianne Berry explained the departments had submitted changes to the miscellaneous fees document. The intention was fee and cost recovery.

Councilor Hyatt wanted to know what it would entail to make the cemetery fund an enterprise fund. Finance Systems Manager Bryn Morrison responded it would take a cost-of-service study to determine what needed to charge to make it self-sufficient. She was not sure it was possible. They would also have to look at gap on whether it would meet the requirements as well.

Councilor DuQuenne confirmed council had the ability to create and adjust fees over the next year. She preferred reviewing the changes one at a time. She thought the fees for planning and building we already high and asked if staff had reviewed other jurisdiction's fees. Community Development Director Brandon Goldman responded there had not been a cost recovery study on planning fees for decades. Fee adjustments were attributed to cost-of-living increase to recapture the funding necessary to pay for the services provided. Those fees were charged to developers proposing actions within the city. Building Permit fees went through a comprehensive review and comparison to other jurisdictions three years before. Council adopted those fees two years ago. Since then, the Building Division had exceeded 100% cost recovery. The Planning Division recovers 60% of expenses and is subsidized by the general fund. City Manager Joe Lessard added if council changed the policy of cost recovery there would not be enough revenue to support the department and they would have to shift funding for the Community Development department from other areas.

Mr. Goldman confirmed these changes were due to CPI and the new fee for food truck ordinance. Additionally, the Engineering Division was no longer collecting a survey plat fee. Addresses and street names had shifted from Public Works to Community Development. He clarified long range planning was covered by the general fund for the Planning Division

**Councilor Dahle/Bloom m/s approval of the Resolution No. 2023-14 titled, "A Resolution Adopting Miscellaneous Fees & Charges Document and Repealing Prior Fee Resolution 2022-13".**

**DISCUSSION:** Councilor Dahle thought the fees were reasonable. Inflation was here and in order to give staff the tools to provide essential services council needed to approve the document. Councilor DuQuenne commented that inflation affected everyone, and items added up like square footage costs for restaurants to use the Calle Guanajuato area. She would not support the motion. Councilor Hyatt thought this was challenging because of the balance it had to strike. Who was using the service and are they paying for the service or is it the taxpayer who pays. There will be times and items that need to be visited but it was inappropriate to expect taxpayers to subsidize another's recreation, or fence permit. She supported the motion.

**Roll Call Vote: Councilor Hyatt, Hansen, Bloom, Dahle, and Kaplan, YES; Councilor DuQuenne, NO. Motion passed 5-1.**

**XI. UNFINISHED BUSINESS - none**

**XII. NEW BUSINESS**

**1. Governor's Emergency Order 2023-02 related "All In" Overnight Shelter Grant**

Community Development Director Brandon Goldman explained the Jackson County Continuum of Care received an allocation from the state of \$8.8 million. the Jackson County Continuum of Care's directive was providing 133 rapid rehousing and sixty-seven shelter beds. The City of Ashland applied for \$1.4million to assist in the acquisition of property for the



development of a congregate shelter that would accommodate 40 individuals. The expectation was that OHRA would provide operations for the emergency shelter until January 10, 2024. Purchasing the asset would allow the city to continue the winter/inclement weather shelter in that facility going forward. The city proposed \$930,000 city funds already in the budget. It would allow the city to purchase and rehabilitate the property and pay OHRA for operations.

Housing Program Manager Linda Reid was thanked for her efforts and involvement in the process.

Staff had not identified the property at this time. They were looking into purchasing a standalone self-cleaning restroom from Portland Loo at \$90,000 but that depended on the price of the property and building. Community Development Block Grants could be used. Mr. Goldman clarified it was not marijuana funds but ending fund balance monies set aside in support of homeless services. Finance Director Marianne Berry furthered clarified there was \$1million in the housing fund that was moved to the general fund for housing services and an emergency shelter.

**Councilor Hyatt/Kaplan m/s to authorize the city manager to enter into a grant agreement for accepting \$1,158,100 in grant funding from the Jackson County Continuum of Care (COC), with understanding that funds are intended for creating new shelter beds, funds will be expended by January 10, 2024, and acceptance of funds are subject to legal review and approval of the proposed grant agreement. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Hyatt thought this was the right thing to do. Councilor Kaplan agreed. Councilor DuQuenne and Dahle thanked Housing Program Manager Linda Reid for her work on the grant. Mayor Graham noted these types of opportunities came from staff, council and being able to partner with community who specialized in this. Now that real resources were coming in, they needed to determine what that master plan looked like.

**Roll Call Vote: Councilor Bloom, Hansen, Kaplan, Hyatt, Dahle, and DuQuenne, YES. Motion passed.**

## **2. Early Learning Small Grant Opportunity—support for up to 35 additional early learning seats in Ashland**

City Manager Joe Lessard identified three efforts needed to increase the viability of the local economy. They were facilities, living wages for childcare providers, and making it affordable for people to live and work in the community. The Ad hoc committee on Affordable Childcare and Early Childhood Development will investigate this in a strategic way.

Councilor Hyatt explained this was an opportunity for the ScienceWorks Museum to purchase two modular classrooms and a bathroom unit at a reduced cost. They were asking for a small grant from the city. It was a good partnership for early learning.

**Councilor Hyatt/Bloom m/s to approve \$5,000 match in small grant money to be awarded to ScienceWorks Museum for the purpose of procuring modulars and early learning opportunity in Ashland. DISCUSSION:** Councilor Hyatt commended Cynthia Sabado and ScienceWorks for their efforts to bring this forward. Councilor Bloom added it demonstrated that in Ashland we are better together. Councilor Hansen appreciated the opportunity. It could be frightening not have childcare. He thanked ScienceWorks, council and staff and thought it would bring more families to Ashland. Councilor Dahle agreed. This was an outstanding example of innovative ideas through collaboration. **Roll Call Vote: Councilor Hansen, Dahle, Kaplan, DuQuenne, Bloom, and Hyatt, YES. Motion passed.**

**XIII. ORDINANCES, RESOLUTIONS AND CONTRACTS – none**

**XIV. OTHER BUSINESS FROM COUNCIL MEMBERS/REPORTS FROM COUNCIL LIAISONS**

Councilor Dahle noted the Airport ad hoc Committee met. Airport Day would not happen this year due to taxi lane reconstruction. The committee was working on scheduling community events though and working with the Chamber on Airport Day 2024.

Councilor Bloom thanked all the agencies that had worked on the fire in the watershed.

**XV. ADJOURNMENT OF BUSINESS MEETING**

**Councilor Bloom/DuQuenne m/s to adjourn the meeting at 9:11 p.m. Voice Vote: ALL AYES. Motion passed.** The meeting adjourned 9:11 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

DocuSigned by:  
*Melissa Huhtala*  
A02A82A0E5E2482  
\_\_\_\_\_  
City Recorder Melissa Huhtala

Attest:

*Tonya Graham*  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Mayor Tonya Graham

## CEAP Goals

### CEAP Goal #1: REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS!

- For the Community: Reduce GHG emissions 8% per year on average, every year to 2050.
- We are not meeting our goals.

How are We Doing?

**POORLY!**

1. Community “Natural” Gas Consumption Rose 10% from 2015 to 2020
2. Gas Meters in Ashland increased 5% from 2015 to 2020
  - 2015 - 6598 Residential + 807 Commercial = 7375 Gas Meters
  - 2020 – 6903 Residential + 842 Commercial = 7745 Gas Meters

“Natural” Gas is composed primarily of methane, which is 80x more potent than CO<sub>2</sub>.

**Reducing the use of “natural” gas is important because:**

- It is a mechanism to reach our CEAP goals and reduce community greenhouse gas emissions.
- There are risks to public health when using “natural gas” in a house.

Methane is the **SECOND** Most Important GHG

Health Impacts  
of Methane  
Exposure

- **Up to a 40% increased risk of childhood asthma exacerbations, and**
- **Up to a 24% increased risk of new asthma.**

How did we get  
here?

1. The Rogue Climate Action Team (RCAT) youth bring Ordinance Proposal to City Council & Council Directs CEPAC to Study Ordinance.
2. US 9th District Court rules Berkely Ordinance not in compliance with federal statute.
3. RCAT proposes change in ordinance to:
  - New Ordinance to include new *residential* construction only
  - Resolution to further study options re: Commercial, Industrial, and substantial remodels

How did we get  
here?

4. RCAT and CEPAC have identified 3 alternative options for an ordinance applying to new residential construction:
  - Emissions bases strategy
  - Local Amendment to the State Building Code
  - Apply Restrictions in New Rights-of-Way

## What is the Ask of Council?

CEPAC (May 24, 2023 ) moves (10-1) to ask City Council to:

1. Direct City Staff (particularly Legal and planning ) to work with CEPAC to bring an appropriate ordinance and resolution back to council ASAP
2. Direct that resources (hours) be given to such an effort
3. Direct CEPAC and RCAT to develop a stakeholder engagement plan.

## Timeline

- Today... Council directs City Planning and Legal Resources to study ordinance and work with CEPAC to draft Ordinance/Resolution
- ASAP... CEPAC and RCAT start stakeholder engagement process planning
- July 12 - Staff and Working Group bring ordinance/resolution to CEPAC Meeting
- Late July, Early August - Formal stakeholder engagement
- Aug - CEPAC votes on final Ordinance/Resolution
- Aug 09 or Sept 05 Council Meeting – First reading of Ordinance.

## Where Do Ashland Emissions Come From?

25% from Residential ,  
Commercial, Industrial Energy  
use:

- 13% Residential
- 11% Commercial
- 1% industrial

To: Mayor Graham and Council  
From: Gay Shaft  
Date: June 5, 2023  
RE: Agenda Item V.1.2 - CEPAC: Greenhouse Gas Emissions Recommendations

#### Introduction

I'm a member of the Climate Environment Policy Advisory Committee (CEPAC).

I was the only CEPAC member to vote against the CEPAC's recommendation on the regulation of emissions from natural gas in new residential construction. I did so because the proposal does not address particulate pollution, a potent greenhouse and environmental pollutant. Listed below are several references explaining why it is critical that the city regulate particulate pollution emissions (i.e. prohibit the use of wood stoves and fireplaces) in new residential construction.

The facts demonstrate and logic would dictate that any regulation focused on reducing the adverse effects of new residential construction on climate and human health would include wood-fired appliances and fireplaces.

#### Just the Facts

Thousands of medical studies have proven beyond any doubt that air pollution causes or exacerbates virtually the same entire list of health outcomes as cigarettes do — heart attacks, strokes, asthma, pneumonia, high blood pressure, shortened life expectancy, chromosomal damage, Alzheimer's, every kind of pregnancy complication, still births, and even sudden death.

But all air pollution is not created equal. Wood smoke is the most toxic type of pollution in most cities, more dangerous than auto pollution and most industrial pollution. Lighting a wood fire in your house is essentially starting up your own mini-toxic waste incinerator.

Wood smoke is unique in containing high concentrations of dioxins and PAHs (polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons), probably the most toxic components of air pollution. Burning 10 lbs. of wood for one hour releases as many PAHs as 35,000 packs of cigarettes. The lifetime cancer risk is 12 times greater for wood smoke compared to an equal volume of second-hand cigarette smoke. Toxic free-radical chemicals in wood smoke are biologically active 40 times longer than the free radicals in cigarette smoke.

The very small size of particles in wood smoke make them seven times more likely to be inhaled than other sources of particulate pollution. For the same reason, wood smoke easily penetrates homes of neighbors creating concentrations indoors up to 88 percent as high as outdoor air. If you smell wood smoke, you know you are being harmed. The sweet smell comes from deadly compounds like benzene. Once you can smell the smoke you know the concentration of particulate matter is dangerously high. The most toxic components of air pollution are much

higher inside homes that burn wood than the homes of non-burners, as much as 500 percent higher.

Wood smoke is the only pollution emitted right where people spend most of their time, at home. It disperses poorly, is not evenly distributed and stays in the air longer because of its small size. Pollution can be 100 times higher for neighbors of wood burners than what is captured at the nearest monitoring station. If your neighbor is a regular wood burner, and follows all the rules, you can go an entire winter without having one single day of clean air. Local "wood burning victims" have their health jeopardized and their lives shortened, even when overall community pollution is low." <https://www.times-standard.com/2017/08/05/burning-firewood-is-an-airborne-public-health-hazard/>

"Oregon Department of Environmental Quality data released Wednesday (Jan. 15, 2020) shows 12.8 million pounds of particulate pollution matter are released into Oregon's air by woodstoves and chimneys each year. Annual particulate matter levels emitted from wood smoke are close to that of a wildfire, DEQ's Susan Mills said." <https://www.opb.org/news/article/oregon-deq-data-woodstove-air-pollution-wildfires/>

"In Portland's Multnomah County, after a series of meetings on woodsmoke pollution in the summer and fall of 2021, a coalition of local, county, and state organizations recommended the county curtail the use of even EPA-certified wood stoves. In addition to doing this, last month, officials in Oregon issued Multnomah County's fourth-ever ban on, and announced that bans could be instituted year-round, rather than just in the fall and winter." <https://undark.org/2022/03/02/wood-burning-stoves-raise-new-health-concerns/>

#### Conclusion

Please instruct the CEPAC to explicitly include particulate pollution in future drafts of greenhouse gas emission reduction ordinances.

*includes Public Forum  
Leda Shapiro*

6/5/23

This Council has stated for a number of years that affordable housing is a high priority.

This has been reflected in the City's stated goals as well as the surveys paid for by the City. In these surveys the closing of the golf Course was put forth as an option for cost cutting, and was a popular choice.

During the budget process, there was a motion to add an amendment to the budget that would do just that—close the Golf Course and save over \$900k. There was also discussion about building affordable housing in that space.

I believe that this option needs to be revisited with an open mind and a collaborative effort to build affordable housing.

We all want Ashland to be a welcoming, livable, diverse community — not just retired white folks — but working people who are able to live here and be part of the community.

It is time to make affordable housing a reality even if it means making hard choices. Please ... I ask you now to do your job with no more excuses or delays.

Leda Shapiro  
Ashland

# Summary of Changes

General Fund									
Expenditures:	Total Administration		\$	1,356,890					
	Houseless Services to CM Budget			1,000,000					
	Mayer and Council Support			146,890					
	Dawn to Dusk/Emergency Shelter			200,000					
	Municipal Court Inmate Software Update			10,000					
	Total Fire Department		\$	1,087,230					
	Fire and Life Safety Temporary Employees			49,789					
	Fire Operations Medical Screening Rebudgeted			92,500					
	Fire Marshal			203,840					
	Fire Training Officer			194,130					
	Fire Department Materials & Services rebudgeted			481,961					
	Additional Wildfire Funding			65,000					
	Recognize existing transfer out for Marijuana Tax			(200,000)					
	Community Development Pre-Approved ADU Plans			30,000					
	Correct PS Budget for Facilities			44,109					
			\$	2,318,219					
	Revenue:	Recognize Higher Carryforward		\$	1,374,461				
Recognize Marijuana Tax proceeds				200,000					
Recognize Health Benefits Revenue				480,000					
Recognize Higher Telecommunications Franchise Fee Revenue				200,000					
		\$	2,254,461						
				Fund Balance	Policy Amount	Over/(Under)	Policy		
Net change to Ending Fund Balance		\$	(63,758)	\$	6,126,633	\$	5,879,933	\$	246,510



## Council & Committee Questions & Responses

Meeting date	Asked by	Question	Response / Notes	Additional support included?	Completed ("Yes or Ongoing")	Date Submitted to Requester
32) 06/06/23	Dylan Bloom	Could you explain what the \$6,686 in rental charges is for? Also, could you show some light on the \$155,478 for contractual services?	The rental charges are for the employer and disbursement leases. Are the contractual services budget as temporary employees. They were previously reflected in salary/wages but have been moved from the personnel category to professional services starting this biennium.	No	Yes	
33) 06/06/23	Leda Shapiro	Link for the Approved Budget	The Form 181 and the Summary of Changes are posted on our Budget website here (https://www.seattle.gov/pages/approval/181837). In tandem with the Proposed Budget, the Summary of Changes reflect what the City Council will be reviewing for potential adoption on the June 6th meeting.	No	Yes	
34) 06/06/23	Leda Shapiro	Whether \$1,200 for housing is the \$1M grant plus \$200K from marijuana tax, or whether the grant is \$1,200 and where is MJ tax, how much is allocated for housing grants that the local non profits apply for.	We received the \$1M Department of Administrative Services grant which is in the budget, and were recently awarded another new grant of \$1,570K from the Continuum of Care (for the State) and is not in the budget. (Director Brandon Goldman will be discussing in 4/5 meetings). We recently applied for it in mid-May and were awarded last week. Marijuana Tax is in Housing Fund (it flows through GF first, but is budgeted in Housing). The annual award of Community Development Block Grants, which are processed through the Housing and Human Services Advisory Committee, are a separate fund in the budget. Please look at the CDGS Fund for an accounting of that expected revenue (HUD provides approximately 170,000K annually to the City) as well as unexpected carryover from prior years.	No	Yes	
35) 06/06/23	Bob Kaplan	What principles are guiding our use of the Housing Fund? For example, why move the \$2M for "houseless services" to the CM budget if these are restricted funds from the state? Wouldn't these be better managed from the housing fund?	It was determined in accordance with the attached ordinance and resolutions. It was determined between Community Development Director Brandon Goldman and City Manager Lesaunder/Denry Sabino Galia the following: "Over the two years of development the ordinance and resolution for the Housing Trust Fund was to create new affordable housing, not simply pay ongoing operations for a shelter activity that did not move people into permanent housing and gain self-sufficiency. My understanding is the City wants more flexibility to use these funds to pay for low-barrier emergency shelter development/operations, meals, clothing, campgrounds, emergency weather shelters, etc. none of which would be considered eligible uses of the HTF given the clients served would not gain self-sufficiency as a result of attending a free meal, or camping in a temporary campground. Additionally, I believe the City wants to use the funding directly, with more flexibility and outside of the regulated tri/award/distribution process dictated by section 7 of the resolution applicable to HTF. As such putting it in a new line item, not the "housing fund" would retain that flexibility."	Yes	Yes	

36) 06/06/23	Bob Kaplan	Also, the housing fund has been receiving \$200K per biennium from marijuana tax revenue. The "summary of changes" suggests it's in the general fund rather than the housing fund for the next biennium. Does putting the \$200,000 in parentheses in the General Fund expenditures mean this is a credit in that fund? On the other hand, the resolution appropriates \$42K in the housing fund, which suggests the \$200K from the marijuana tax may be there after all.	The \$200K marijuana tax revenue is in the Housing Fund. We were just showing a flow of the funds and have updated the Summary of Changes table to make that better understood. Essentially, in accordance with our standard that funds from a general source of revenue go to the General Fund first, it is then moved to the appropriate budget, in this case Housing.	No	Yes	
37) 06/06/23	Bob Kaplan	In summary of changes, why is "recognize higher telecommunications revenue of \$200K" in the general fund rather than the telecommunications fund?	It is actually higher telecom franchise fees, which goes to the General Fund.	No	Yes	

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE ASHLAND MUNICIPAL CODE, ADDING A NEW CHAPTER 4.36, PROVIDING FOR THE ESTABLISHMENT OF AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND

Annotated to show deletions and additions to the code sections being modified. Deletions are lined-through and additions are in bold.

WHEREAS, Article 2, Section 1 of the Ashland City Charter provides:

**Powers of the City.** The City shall have all powers which the constitutions, statutes, and common law of the United States and of this State expressly or impliedly grant or allow municipalities, as fully as though this Charter specifically enumerated each of those powers, as well as all powers not inconsistent with the foregoing; and, in addition thereto, shall possess all powers hereinafter specifically granted. All the authority thereof shall have perpetual succession.

WHEREAS, the above referenced grant of power has been interpreted as affording all legislative powers home rule constitutional provisions reserved to Oregon Cities, *City of Beaverton v. International Ass'n of Firefighters, Local 1860, Beaverton Shop, 20 Or. App. 255,531 P.2d 730, 734 (1975)*; and

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Ashland has determined that in order to protect the health, safety and welfare of existing and future residents of Ashland who are adversely impacted by the lack of housing available to all income types, specifically very low, low, and moderate income households, it is necessary to establish a fund to support the development, preservation, and rehabilitation, of needed housing types within the City; and

WHEREAS the City of Ashland City Council recognizes that for a healthy community the provision of a range of affordable housing opportunities and funding mechanisms for affordable development is a top priority for the City of Ashland; and

WHEREAS, the City Council of the City of Ashland has determined that neither the private market, nor the public sector, has yet provided the levels of housing affordability necessary to maintain a balanced community; local government must take an active lead to ensure an adequate supply of housing for residents and working people of all income levels;

THE PEOPLE OF THE CITY OF ASHLAND DO ORDAIN AS FOLLOWS:

**SECTION 1.** A new Chapter 4.36 [AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND] is hereby added to the Ashland Municipal Code to read as follows:

**Chapter 4.36 AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND**

- Section 4.36.010 Purpose**
- Section 4.36.020 Definitions**
- Section 4.36.030 Dedication of Revenue**

**A. There is hereby established and created an Affordable Housing Trust Fund, [AHTF], a separate account established by the City of Ashland Finance Department for purposes consistent with this ordinance and to provide a discrete account for earmarked affordable housing funds and dedicated affordable housing funds.**

**B. The AHTF allows for dedicated funds to be used in support of Affordable Housing Priorities through receipt of donations and dedicated revenue streams, including but not limited to donations, grants, sale of surplus City Property, or any other revenue sources approved by the Ashland City Council or the People of Ashland.**

**C. Distribution of funds shall be in accordance with the policies and procedures per Resolution 2008-~~37~~**

**4.36.040 Establishment of Policies and Procedures**

**The Administrative Procedures associated with the AHTF, including fund administration, determination of eligible applicants, eligible uses and activities, award preferences, eligibility criteria, award process, and selection criteria are initially approved by the City Council per establishment of Resolution 2008-~~37~~**

**SECTION 2.** Severability. The sections, subsections, paragraphs and clauses of this ordinance are severable. The invalidity of one section, subsection, paragraph, or clause shall not affect the validity of the remaining sections, subsections, paragraphs and clauses.

**SECTION 3.** Codification. Provisions of this Ordinance shall be incorporated in the City Code and the word "ordinance" may be changed to "code", "article", "section", or another word, and the sections of this Ordinance may be renumbered, or re-lettered, provided however that any Whereas clauses and boilerplate provisions (i.e. Sections 2-3) need not be codified and the City Recorder is authorized to correct any cross-references and any typographical errors.

The foregoing ordinance was first read by title only in accordance with Article X, Section 2(C) of the City Charter on the 16 day of September, 2008, and **PASSED and ADOPTED** this 7 day of October, 2008.

*Barbara M. Christensen*  
Barbara M. Christensen, City Recorder

SIGNED and APPROVED this 8 day of October, 2008  
*John W. Mortson*  
John W. Mortson, Mayor

Reviewed by *[Signature]*  
Richard [Name], City Attorney

RESOLUTION NO. 2008-34

A RESOLUTION ESTABLISHING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES FOR ADMINISTRATION OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND

RECITALS:

- A. WHEREAS,** the City of Ashland City Council approved the establishment of the Affordable Housing Trust Fund (Ordinance 2966), to keep our community diverse by facilitating the production and preservation of affordable housing throughout Ashland; and
- B. WHEREAS,** the policies and procedures for administration of the Affordable Housing Trust Fund establish eligible uses, eligible applicants, the method by which funds are awarded, and selection criteria; and
- C. WHEREAS,** the City Council understands the changing nature of the housing market and corresponding housing needs, and therefore has established the policies and procedures for administering the Ashland Housing Trust Fund (AHTF) to remain flexible to respond to changing market conditions and opportunities; now therefore

THE CITY OF ASHLAND RESOLVES AS FOLLOWS:

**SECTION 1. Purpose**

- 1.1** The purpose of the City of Ashland's Affordable Housing Trust Fund (AHTF) is to establish a dedicated source of revenue to provide ongoing funding for housing projects or programs that address the housing needs of Ashland residents. To this end the AHTF is established to address the primary purpose of encouraging the creation of housing for homeownership or rent, at a cost that will enable low and moderate income families to afford quality housing while paying no more than thirty per cent of gross household income on housing.
- 1.2** To promote the rehabilitation, preservation and production of quality, well designed rental and ownership housing the AHTF will award funds to community development partners that are furthering the AHTF mission. It is expected that the local contributions made through Ashland's Affordable Housing Trust Fund will assist in maximizing the leveraging of State and Federal funds, as well as encourage private sector investment in affordable housing.



- 3.4 Affordable housing units developed utilizing subsidy from the Affordable Housing Trust Fund shall comply with the income, rent and purchase housing cost limits established by Resolution 2006-13, as amended, and as restricted by a covenant prepared by the City of Ashland.
- 3.5 The Affordable Housing Trust Funds can be provided as either a grant or a loan depending on the project or program receiving funding. To retain a significant degree of flexibility the eligible uses have a broad application including the following:
- 3.5.a **Acquisition and Construction of new affordable housing.** Eligible acquisition and construction costs include reasonable costs associated with building or land purchase, including but not limited to:
- Purchase price
  - Option costs
  - Financing fees
  - Appraisal costs
  - Closing costs
  - Interest
  - Inspection fees
  - Title Insurance
  - Relocation costs
  - Architectural/engineering fees
  - Construction costs
- 3.5.b **Conservation of energy** through the use of "green" technologies provided that the benefits of the energy savings is passed on in the form of reduced costs to the qualified occupants of the affordable housing.
- 3.5.c **Land Banking:** the purchase of land to be dedicated toward the development of affordable housing in the near or long term.
- 3.5.d **Predevelopment activities** undertaken by a community development organization in support of the development of affordable housing including planning, architectural services, engineering services, landscape design, legal services, surveys, appraisals, site clearance and demolition, environmental clearance, permit application fees and system development charges.

- 4.1.a Developments that produce "new" affordable housing units. *New affordable housing units* shall include housing units constructed where none had existed previously, abandoned or fire-damaged residential units to be returned to residential use, and non-residential or non-residentially-zoned property converted to residential use. Any designated new affordable housing units shall be secured as affordable through recorded Resale Restriction Covenants.
- 4.1.b Developments that provide new affordability. *New affordability* refers to existing housing where a new level of affordability is provided that does not currently exist. This could occur in rental or ownership housing where the number of affordable units is increased; where a portion of existing units will be made affordable to households at income levels substantially lower than the units previously served; or where the term of affordability on the units will be extended for a period beyond thirty (30) years.
- 4.1.c Developments of housing utilizing the Land Trust model to secure property and perpetual affordability.
- 4.1.d Developments that include joint ventures between multiple non-profit developers and/or for-profit developers, working in partnership, to complete an affordable housing project.
- 4.1.e Developments that include a joint venture between service providers and non-profit affordable housing developers to create projects that contain additional benefits to low income individuals in the development of the project, or additional services for the residents upon completion.
- 4.1.f Developments that incorporate the use of "green" building materials, use of energy-efficient appliances, low-water use landscaping, and incorporation of building design and operational factors that minimize energy use and resource consumption as well as avoid indoor health impacts to achieve Earth Advantage Certification.
- 4.1.g Developments that include affordable units for the disabled and the homeless.
- 4.1.h Projects that propose long term affordability.
- 4.1.i Projects that are sponsored by non-profit organizations.

- 5.7 Affordable Housing Trust Funds will be allocated in a manner consistent with the threshold criteria provided Section 8, and consistent with State and Local Public Contracting law.

**Section 6. Match Requirements**

- 6.1 The Ashland Housing Trust Fund is intended to support the development of needed housing, but is not intended to provide the sole source of funding for any development project or housing program. To ensure that affordable housing providers, and organizations that assist individuals and families in obtaining needed housing, do not rely exclusively on AHTF to support their activities, it has been determined that:
- 6.2 The Affordable Housing Trust Fund contribution shall not exceed more than 50% of the total project or program cost. Required Match can be met utilizing Community Development Block Grants, State or Federal Funding, direct contribution from the applicant, private donations, and the contribution of land, materials or labor to the project.
- 6.2.a In the case that land previously owned by the applicant is considered as required match, the value of the land shall be determined by a City approved certified appraisal completed by the applicant, unless otherwise directed in Oregon Revised Statute or City Municipal Code.
- 6.2.b The valuation of land, and available equity to be considered as matching funds, shall be verified by the City prior to the disbursement of an AHTF grant when its value is considered as required matching funds.
- 6.2.c Donated materials and labor which are proposed as required match through the development of a project shall have their value estimated at the time of application. The actual value of these contributions is subject to verification by the City at completion of the project.
- 6.2.d Award recipients shall provide verifiable accounting for donated labor and materials, when such was necessary to satisfy the AHTF match requirements.
- 6.3 A recipient of an AHTF grant that fails to verify the match requirements have been satisfied at the conclusion of a project

- 7.1 b City Staff shall assess the project proposals to determine if the eligibility criteria are met and shall develop a recommendation to provide to the Ashland Housing Commission and the City Council.
- 7.1 c The Ashland Housing Commission will provide applicants the opportunity to make a presentation on their project proposal and provide community members the opportunity to comment by holding a public meeting.
- 7.1 d The Ashland Housing Commission will develop a grant award recommendation to the City Council using the AHTF criteria to determine which projects best meet the City's spending priorities. Each application will be rated on a numeric scale as established in the annual RFP for each criterion of selection (Section 8).
- 7.1 e The Ashland City Council shall make a final decision on the award of Affordable Housing Trust Funds.
- 7.1 f The City of Ashland shall prepare an agreement between the City and the award recipient. The Agreement shall outline the conditions of award and shall be executed prior to the disbursement of any Affordable Housing Trust Funds.
- 7.2. Notice of Funding Availability (NOFA)  
Upon electing to initiate a Notice of Funding Availability (NOFA) the City shall issue a notice of funding availability through publication in the Ashland Daily Tidings and on the City's Website providing 30 days for eligible applicants to submit qualifications for funding. The City shall review all applications received to determine if the applications meet the City's threshold criteria. If the criteria are met then the funds are awarded to, or reserved for, the applicant. Funds available through the NOFA process are awarded on a first come, first served basis, until reaching the annual funding cap. A reserve award granted to an applicant may be rescinded by the City if the applicant does not undertake the activities identified in response to the NOFA in advance of the City's issuance of another RFP or NOFA.
- 7.2.a On an annual basis the City shall determine the amount of funds available to be distributed through a NOFA procedure
- 7.2.b In no case shall the amount disbursed through the non-competitive process exceed 10% of the annual AHTF revenue in a given program year.

9

- 8.02 If the project is related to the provision of technical assistance to affordable housing providers, the use of Ashland Housing Trust Funds functions to increase the capacity of the organization to specifically address the mission of the AHTF. (threshold verification).
- 8.03 Affordable Housing Trust funds shall be limited to the minimum amount necessary to complete the project. The lower the percentage of AHTF funds requested, relative to the full project costs, the higher ranking the project shall be given.
- 8.04 The project addresses the unmet housing needs as identified in the Ashland Housing Needs analysis or Consolidated Plan.
- 8.05 The lower the income level that is targeted for the benefiting households, the higher the ranking the project shall be given.
- 8.06 The project provides new affordable housing, or new affordability, through retention or rehabilitation of existing housing, within the City. The greater the number of units provided, the higher the ranking the project shall be given.
- 8.07 The project retains the affordable housing units as affordable. The longer period of time the units remain affordable, the higher ranking the project shall be given.
- 8.08 The project addresses energy conservation through the integration of green building technologies in new construction, or achieves greater energy efficiency through rehabilitation of existing housing.
- 8.09 The project maximizes partnerships in the community (volunteers, in-kind contributions, cash contributions, multiple organizations involved, etc.).
- 8.10 The project utilizes already existing resources in effective and innovative ways. The project shall not duplicate service provided by another organization.
- 8.11 The agency submitting the proposal has the capacity to carry out the project and has had demonstrated successes completing projects of similar scope.
- 8.12 The budget and time line are thorough and realistic.
- 8.13 The project is ready for implementation.

11

**Speaker Request Form**  
THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD  
ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphones.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written material, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: Monday, 10/12/2010  
Name: Becky Prockmiller

Agenda topic/item number: Becky Prockmiller  
Topic for public forum (see agenda item):

**Land Use Public Hearing**

Please indicate the following:  
For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias

If you are challenging a member (city councillor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceedings and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.

Written Comments/Challenges: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forum on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Disobedience or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees or the City of Ashland.

Speaker Request Form  
THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD  
ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: 11/23  
Name: [REDACTED]

Regular Meeting

Agenda topic/item number: 2.11.15.1 OR C.H.C. Spec. Proc.  
Topic for public forum (see agenda item):

Land Use Public Hearing

Please indicate the following:  
For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**  
If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.  
Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forum on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees or the City of Ashland.

Speaker Request Form

THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD  
ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: 11/23  
Name: NOEL CHATROUX

Regular Meeting

Agenda topic/item number: 2.11.15.1 OR  
Topic for public forum (see agenda item):

Land Use Public Hearing

Please indicate the following:  
For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**  
If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.  
Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forum on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees or the City of Ashland.

Speaker Request Form

THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD  
ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: 11/23  
Name: LENA STAPARO

Regular Meeting

Agenda topic/item number: OR  
Topic for public forum (see agenda item): Closure of 1501

Land Use Public Hearing

Please indicate the following:  
For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**  
If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.  
Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forum on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees or the City of Ashland.

6/5/23

This Council has stated for a number of years that affordable housing is a high priority.

This has been reflected in the City's stated goals as well as the surveys paid for by the City. In these surveys the closing of the golf course was put forth as an option for cost cutting, and was a popular choice.

During the budget process, there was a motion to add an amendment to the budget that would do just that—close the Golf Course and save over \$900k. There was also discussion about building affordable housing in that space.

I believe that this option needs to be revisited with an open mind and a collaborative effort to build affordable housing.

We all want Ashland to be a welcoming, livable, diverse community – not just retired white folks – but working people who are able to live here and be part of the community.

It is time to make affordable housing a reality even if it means making hard choices. Please ... I ask you now to do your job with no more excuses or delays.

Leda Shapiro  
Ashland

**Speaker Request Form**  
THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD  
ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: 6/6/23  
Name: Kelly Marcotulli



Agenda topic/item number: \_\_\_\_\_ OR \_\_\_\_\_  
Topic for public forum (non agenda item): Telecom Ordinance

**Land Use Public Hearing**

Please indicate the following:  
For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**

If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.

Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

*The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forum on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.*

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees of the City of Ashland.

**Speaker Request Form**  
THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD  
ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: 6 June 2023  
Name: MICHAEL RISP



Agenda topic/item number: \_\_\_\_\_ OR \_\_\_\_\_  
Topic for public forum (non agenda item): Telecommunication

**Land Use Public Hearing**

Please indicate the following:  
For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**

If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.

Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

*The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forum on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.*

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees of the City of Ashland.

**Speaker Request Form**  
**THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD**  
**ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC**

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: 6/4/2023  
 Name: PAUL SHELDON

**Regular Meeting**

Agenda topic/item number \_\_\_\_\_ OR \_\_\_\_\_  
 Topic for public forum (non agenda item) 5G/E/F

**Land Use Public Hearing**

Please indicate the following: For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**

If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.

Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

*The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forums on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.*

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees or the City of Ashland.

**Speaker Request Form**  
**THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD**  
**ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC**

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: 6/6/23  
 Name: ARON HUSSAUS

**Regular Meeting**

Agenda topic/item number cell phone OR redaction  
 Topic for public forum (non agenda item) 1

**Land Use Public Hearing**

Please indicate the following: For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: \_\_\_\_\_

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**

If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.

Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

*The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forums on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.*

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees or the City of Ashland.

**Speaker Request Form**  
**THIS FORM IS A PUBLIC RECORD**  
**ALL INFORMATION PROVIDED WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC**

- 1) Complete this form and return it to the City Recorder prior to the discussion of the item you wish to speak about.
- 2) Speak to the City Council from the table podium microphone.
- 3) State your name and address for the record.
- 4) Limit your comments to the amount of time given to you by the Mayor, usually 3 or 5 minutes.
- 5) If you present written materials, please give a copy to the City Recorder for the record.
- 6) You may give written comments to the City Recorder for the record if you do not wish to speak. (Comments can be added to the back of this sheet if necessary)
- 7) Speakers are solely responsible for the content of their public statement.

Tonight's Meeting Date: JUNE 6, 2023  
 Name: PHILIP TOY

**Regular Meeting**

Agenda topic/item number \_\_\_\_\_ OR \_\_\_\_\_  
 Topic for public forum (non agenda item) 5G + cell towers

**Land Use Public Hearing**

Please indicate the following: For: \_\_\_\_\_ Against: X

**Challenge for Conflict of Interest or Bias**

If you are challenging a member (a city councilor or a planning commissioner) with a conflict of interest or bias, please write your allegation complete with supporting facts on this form and deliver it to the clerk immediately. The Presiding Officer will address the written challenge with the member. Please be respectful of the proceeding and do not interrupt. You may also provide testimony about the challenge when you testify during the normal order of proceedings.

Written Comments/Challenge: \_\_\_\_\_

*The Public Meeting Law requires that all city meetings are open to the public. Oregon law does not always require that the public be permitted to speak. The Ashland City Council generally invites the public to speak on agenda items and during public forums on non-agenda items unless time constraints limit public testimony. No person has an absolute right to speak or participate in every phase of a proceeding. Please respect the order of proceedings for public hearings and strictly follow the directions of the presiding officer. Behavior or actions which are unreasonably loud or disruptive are disrespectful, and may constitute disorderly conduct. Offenders will be requested to leave the room.*

Comments and statements by speakers do not represent the opinion of the City Council, City Officers or employees or the City of Ashland.