

# HISTORIC COMMISSION ELECTRONIC MEETING AGENDA <u>January 5, 2022 6PM</u>

# I. <u>6:00PM - REGULAR MEETING – CALL TO ORDER</u>

# II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Historic Commission electronic meeting of December 8, 2021

# III. PUBLIC FORUM

# IV. COUNCIL LIAISON REPORT

Councilor Moran

# V. PLANNING ACTION REVIEW

# VI. <u>DISCUSSION ITEMS</u>

- Marking Ashland Places Update- Jennifer Longshore
- Community Center
- Seated member quorum discussion
- Historic Preservation Week PastForward
  - o Historic Preservation Awards scheduled for Tues, May 17th @12:30
    - Pioneer Hall has been reserved(with indoor or outdoor option)

# VII. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

# ASHLAND HISTORIC COMMISSION ELECTRONIC MEETING DDAFT Mosting Minutes

# DRAFT Meeting Minutes

December 8, 2021

#### Community Development/Engineering Services Building – Electronic Meeting

#### CALL TO ORDER:

Hovenkamp called the zoom meeting to order at 6:00pm.

Commissioners Present:	Council Liaison:
Shostrom	Shaun Moran
Whitford	Staff Present:
Von Chamier	Maria Harris; Planning Dept.
Emery	Derek Severson; Planning Dept
Skibby	Regan Trapp; Permit Technician II
Hovenkamp	
Swink	
Commissioners Absent:	ALL PRESENT

#### APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Shostrom/Whitford m/s to approve minutes for September 8, 2021. Voice vote. ALL AYES. Motion passed.

#### **PUBLIC FORUM:**

There was no one wishing to speak.

#### **COUNCIL LIAISON REPORT:**

Councilor Moran gave Council Liaison report. Items discussed were:

- The first reading of the annexation code amendments was presented to Council.
- The Community Center will move forward with the Ad-Hoc Committee's proposal approved by the Council.

Hovenkamp read aloud the procedures for Public Hearings.

#### PLANNING ACTION REVIEW

PLANNING ACTION: PA-T1-2021-00164 SUBJECT PROPERTY: 101 A Street OWNER: Blue Marble/Jordan Willing

APPLICANT: Chris Brown, Arkitek: Design & Architecture

**DESCRIPTION:** A request for Site Design Review approval to permit a remodel and an 8,159 square foot addition to the building at 101 A Street. Proposed improvements include re-roofing; constructing a new rooftop addition and solar array and replacing rooftop mechanical equipment; installing new exterior stairs, exterior windows, awnings and a dormer; constructing interior second floor space; installing a parking area gate to regulate access; and adding new plaza space with seating. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** Employment; **ZONING:** E-1 with Historic, Residential and Detail Site Review Overlays; **MAP:** 39 1E 09BA; **TAX LOT:** 14600 & 14900

There was no conflict of interest or ex-parte contact indicated by the Commission.

Severson gave the staff report for PA-T1-2021-00164.

Hovenkamp opened the public hearing to the applicants.

#### Applicant's present:

- Christopher Brown, Arkitek
- Ian White, Arkitek
- Paul Turner, Arkitek

Chris Brown introduced himself and his team. He announced that this project is an adaptive re-use of a building that is a landmark feature of the railroad district in Ashland and will revitalize the A' Street Corridor. Ian White gave a summary on the history of the site and the project. Paul Turner stated that this would be a modern addition to offset the historical qualities of the building and that it was important to keep the setback from all sides of the building on the rooftop addition. They wanted to work with the vision of what is already there and stay within the existing material palette. The team's goal is to strip out the finishes from what Plexis added and return the historical character of the building.

Emery & Shostrom like the original proposal and agreed that, visually from south to north, it becomes more massive as compared to the original proposal. Emery acknowledged that although it's more massive it is a good use of the space.

The Commission thanked the applicants for their detailed plans.

Hovenkamp closed the public hearing to the applicants.

Emery/Shostrom m/s to approve PA-T1-2021-00164 with recommendation. Voice vote. ALL AYES. Motion passed.

# **Commission Recommendation:**

The Historic Commission commends the applicant on the design and effort to remodel and repurpose a significant historic structure. The Commission also commends the applicant for the excellent application materials, as well as the presentation of the perspectives, elevations and site plans at the Commission meeting. The presentation and materials assisted greatly in understanding the proposed changes to the building exterior and third story addition.

The Historic Commission recommends reducing the plate height from ten to eight feet in height to minimize the visual impact of the mass and scale of the third-story addition from a variety of views from a pedestrian's perspective on A Street – see applicable design standards (below).

#### Historic District Design Standards 18.4.2.050.B

- 3. <u>Scale</u>. Recommended: Height, width, and massing of new buildings conform to historic buildings in the immediate vicinity. Avoid: Height, width, or massing of new buildings that is out of scale with historic buildings in the vicinity.
- 4. <u>Massing</u>. Recommended: Small, varied masses consistent with historic buildings in the immediate vicinity. Avoid: Single, monolithic forms that are not relieved by variations in massing.

#### Large Scale Projects, 18.4.2.040.D

- 1. Orientation and Scale.
  - a. Developments shall divide large building masses into heights and sizes that relate to human scale by incorporating changes in building masses or direction, sheltering roofs, a distinct pattern of divisions on surfaces, windows, trees, and small scale lighting.

#### **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

Membership and attendance:

- Harris emphasized that there are 2 vacancies on the Commission that have not been filled for over a year.
   Staff suggests supporting an amendment to reduce the Commission to 7 seated members. This would be a council decision with the ordinance to be drafted by Staff. The Commission asked staff to investigate the following:
  - Having a "seated member quorum" (Like Tree Commission)
  - o Reduce design review to 2x a month (with only 2 people)

**Shostrom made a motion** – Further discussion ensued as to what the motion should be.

Shostrom/Swink m/s to direct staff to research keeping Commission seats at 9 but use the "seated member quorum." ALL AYES. Motion passed.

Community Center discussion:

- The Commission discussed in detail Shostrom's letter that was read aloud to Council back in September.
- Councilor Moran summarized the Ad-Hoc Committee's decision and what the next steps will be.
- The Commission conveyed that they would like to identify their role in this important matter, and formally address Council in the near future. They decided that they would study all the information from the November Packet and come together to discuss this topic at the next meeting in January.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

Next meeting is scheduled for January 5, 2022 at 6:00pm via Zoom.

There being no other items to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:14 pm

Respectfully submitted by Regan Trapp, Permit Technician II

September 19, 2021

RE Agenda Item: Winburn Way, Ad Hoc Committee, Final Report

Honorable Mayor and City Council Members,

My name is Dale Shostrom. I am currently a member of the Ashland Historic Commission and have served the City as a commissioner for over 22 years, where I help carry out the Commissions' charge to preserve the integrity of our historic structures and resources. I am speaking to express some thoughts and concerns regarding the proposal submitted by the Winburn Way ad hoc Committee. Because the Historic Commission has not met since the proposal was submitted, I am speaking on behalf of myself and not the Commission as a whole.

I have worked as a designer/builder in Ashland since moving here in 1974 and have collaborated with many structural engineers during my career. In the early spring of this year, by previous order of the City Council, I was invited by the Public Works Dept. to provide technical expertise and community representation in the evaluation of Engineering and Architectural firms that had submitted proposals to provide comprehensive evaluations of Pioneer Hall and the Community Center. During this process I developed a robust understanding of the condition of these structures via on-site visits with architects and engineers and I thoroughly reviewed all the documents, architectural drawings, engineering reports that pertain to these buildings.

In my opinion these buildings have some serious structural deficiencies and deferred maintenance issues. Pioneer Hall has been well investigated in recent years, whereas the Community Center has had only a preliminary report on the structural deficiencies of the roof and north wall of the main hall auditorium.

I think the ad hoc Committees' proposal can safely re-open these buildings. I whole heartedly agree with the need to get these buildings open for public uses and to find cost effective solutions. But the ad hoc charge to 'develop least-cost recommendations' falls short aesthetically and impedes the opportunity for historic restoration.

My major concern is with the Community Center auditorium ceiling and the proposed fix, by the installation of a **steel moment frame**. The existing curved vaulted ceiling covers an open floor area of 30 feet by 40 feet. The ad hoc Committees' structural solution is comprised of a series of asymmetrically spaced steel beams, headers, and post (wrapped in drywall) that will completely overpower and interrupt the historic openness, simplicity, and detailing of this beautifully vaulted auditorium.

Further, this utilitarian retrofit support system will complicate or permanently eliminate future opportunities to restore the north wall and roof systems, without the additional wasteful expenditure that will be needed to remove the steel moment frame. Specifically, the Committees' recommendation would severely restrict or preclude future repair of the sagging floor and compromised foundation, the outward leaning windows and wall, and the 15-inch-deep belly in the exterior roof plane. The consensus engineering solution, to remedy all these problems, has been to remove the existing roof structure and rebuild with new wood trusses. I believe the proposed **steel moment frame** is a totally unacceptable solution, both aesthetically and historically.

As a next step, we need to develop cost-effective design solutions that address safety concerns, longevity of the structure, and preservation of key historic design features, as previously directed by Council. By incorporating the ad hoc Committees' findings, we can simplify a new 'preliminary design and engineering phase'. Because the City may need to re-open a competitive solicitation process for engineering services regardless of the path forward, a more economical opportunity to better assess the long-term needs of these buildings is not likely to occur again soon. This phase should facilitate public input, needs analysis, and budgets. The resulting "menu" and price list of repairs, improvements, and restorations will enable Council and the community to better prioritize which actions should be performed over time.

These buildings are nearly a century old. It is time for a detailed evaluation that will guide decisions to ensure our historic public resources will serve the Ashland community for another 100 years.

Respectfully,
Dale Shostrom



# Memo

DATE: 1/05/2022

TO: Historic Commission

FROM: Brandon Goldman, Senior Planner

RE: Commission Membership and Quorum Requirements

Tel: 541-488-5305

Fax: 541-488-6006

TTY: 800-735-2900

The City of Ashland has 14 standing Commissions that regularly meet to review and advice on projects and policies that relate to their areas of expertise. There are numerous additional committees, boards, and ad hoc groups that convene to address specific City related business of the course of the year. Advisory Commissions and boards are established consistent with <a href="Chapter 2.10">Chapter 2.10</a>, Uniform Policies and operating procedures for Advisory Commissions and Boards, of the Ashland Municipal Code. This code aims to provide require uniform rules, policies and operating procedures to assure maximum productivity and fairness for members and the public. <a href="Chapter 2.10">Chapter 2.10</a> provides standardized rules for all City Commissions relating to operations including but not limited to public meeting law, ethics, appointments, meeting attendance, and quorum requirements. In addition to Chapter 2.10, each Commission is governed by a separate subsection of Ch. 2.10 which will outline the powers and duties of the specific Commission, as well as provide for membership qualification and number. The Historic Commission has requested information regarding the established membership of other City Commissions, and specifically in relation to the membership number of each commission.

The makeup of the Historic Commission's membership is set forth in <u>Chapter 2.24</u>, Historic Commission, of the Ashland Municipal Code. Any change to this section, including revisions to the number of members or quorum limits, would require an ordinance amending the Municipal Code be approved by the City Council. A recommendation from the Historic Commission regarding any such membership revisions would be presented to the City Manager for inclusion on a future Council agenda for consideration.



# <u>Background</u> City Commission Membership and Vacancies – current as of December 2021.

Commission	Membership number	Currently	Quorum
		Appointed	Requirement
		Members	
Airport	9	8	5
Climate Policy	9	6	5
Conservation	9	7	5
Forest Lands	7	6	4
Historic	9	7	5
Housing and Human	9	9	5
Services			
Municipal Audit	4	3	3
Parks and Recreation	5	5	3
	(elected)		
Planning	7	6	4
Public Arts	7	5	4
Social Equity and	9-11	10	6
Racial Justice			(1/2 seated plus 1)
Tree	5-7	4	3
			(1/2 seated plus 1)
Transportation	7	7	4
Wildfire Safety	9	7	5

#### Tree Commission Membership and Quorum Requirements.

Tel: 541-488-5305

Fax: 541-488-6006

TTY: 800-735-2900

In July of 2008 the Ashland City Council approved an ordinance amending the Ashland Municipal Code (AMC) to revise the number of Tree Commission members and the definition of a quorum for this commission. At the time the Tree Commission had experienced several canceled meetings in the prior year(s) due to a lack of members and the corresponding inability to achieve a quorum in the event appointed commissioners were absent, and/or appointments to available seats had remained unfilled. Creating an allowance for the commission to reduce the number of Commissioners from seven to five allowed a quorum to be met when only three members were present. This reduction enabled the Commission to regularly achieve a quorum and thus satisfy their responsibility to hold meetings to review planning actions and tree removal permit applications.

The flexibility to appoint up to seven (7) members was retained in the AMC, however recruitment and appointment of additional Tree Commission members has continued to remain difficult. As of December 2021, there are presently four currently appointed members on the Tree Commission, with three open vacancies. Therefore, three of the four currently seated members must be present to satisfy the quorum requirements and conduct a public meeting.



#### **AMC 2.25.010 Established Membership**

The Tree Commission is established and shall consist of no less than five members nor more than seven voting members. There shall also be three nonvoting ex officio members consisting of a member of the City Council, a representative of the Community Development Department and a representative of the Parks and Recreation Department. (Ord. 3003, amended, 02/18/2010; Ord. 2962, amended, 07/15/2008)

#### **AMC 2.25.030 Quorum Rules and Meetings**

Notwithstanding any other provision of this code, a quorum shall be defined as one-half the number of sitting Commissioners, plus one, but in no case less than three. (Ord. 3003, amended, 02/18/2010; Ord. 2962, amended, 07/15/2008)

#### Social Equity and Racial Justice Commission Membership and Quorum Requirements

The Ashland Social Equity and Racial Justice Commission was established in May of 2021. This Commission was established to allow as few as nine (9) voting members, and as many as eleven (11). As of December 2021, there are presently ten (10) appointed members. The quorum requirement is established as more than ½ the appointed members, and no less than five (5). With 10 appointed members the quorum requirement is six members.

#### **AMC 2.20.010 Establishment – Membership**

Tel: 541-488-5305

Fax: 541-488-6006 TTY: 800-735-2900

B. The Social Equity and Racial Justice Commission shall consist of no fewer than nine (9) and no more than eleven (11) voting members. All voting members shall reside within the corporate limits of the City of Ashland.

#### **AMC 2.20.020 Meetings and Rules**

A. Notwithstanding any other provision of this code, a quorum of the Social Equity and Racial Justice Commission shall consist of more than one-half (½) of the total number of its current Council-confirmed voting members, but in no case fewer than five (5).



Permit number	Permit Address	Group Assign	Permit description	Approval state	Final date	Owner Last Name	Owner First	Owner Address	Appdate	Customer Info
ARU							Name			
BD-R-2019-00343	170 Harrison	Т	ARU with 2 car garage below	Issued		Anderson	Richard	176 Harrison	10/10/2019	By Owner
BD-R-2020-00431	99 Pine		Existing studio conversion to ARU	Final	2/1/2021		Kurt/Michel			Rob Gibson
BD-R-2021-00670	9 Nutley		Move historic bungalow	Issued	_, _, _, _	Mastain	Mardi	114 Granite	<u> </u>	Mardi Mastain
BD-R-2019-00363 & 00356	373/377 Vista		ARU and first floor addition	Final	12/1/2021		Michael		<u> </u>	By Owner
ADDITION										
BD-R-2019-00364	163 Eighth St/882 B S	Street	Addition/remodel to side of home	Final	9/17/2020	Niblev	Chris/Debi	163 Eighth, Ash	12/5/2019	Ben The Builder
BD-R-2021-00581	104 Bush	1	Garage addition 70 SF	Final	10/14/2021	•	William/Nar			Coleman Creek
BD-R-2019-00293	324 Avery		Detached addition	Final	4/13/2021		_	324 Avery, Ashl		Nick David
BD-R-2019-00233	620 Iowa		Additon & interior remodel of SFR	Final	10/1/2020			252 Amesport,		Rick Vezie
BD-R-2020-00439	123 Church		Master bedroom addition at rear of home	Final	12/16/2020		Judith	123 Church		Stewart Builders
BD-R-2020-00426	172 Alida		Addition	Final	8/31/2020		Jesse			Asher homes
BD-R-2020-00404	123 High		Garage conversion & remodel/Add deck	Final	5/26/2021		George			David Scott Const
BD-R-2020-00405	73 Pine		Addition & remodel	Final		Yula Ckaire		1		Josh Barnes Const.
BD-R-2020-00402	542 Siskiyou		Addition, covered patio, garage expansion	Final	8/19/2020		Larry	1		Asher Homes
BD-R-2020-00455	835-839 E. Main	1	Addition for downstairs dance studio/Upstairs office	Issued	5, . 5, 2520	Burnett	Samara	1		By Owner
BD-R-2020-00469	843 B Street		2nd floor addition	Issued		Cardose	Hank			By Owner
BD-R-2019-00364	163 Eighth		Small addtion/remodel	Final	9/17/2020		Chris			Ben the builder
BD-R-2021-00577	92 Dewey		Detached guest cottage	Final	12/1/2021		Kenneth/Pa	ntrice	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Shostrom Bros
BD-R-2021-00581	104 Bush		Garage addition 70 SF	Final	10/14/2021		Ttermieeriy re	T	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Coleman Creek
BD-R-2021-00586	259 N. Laurel		Addition and remodel. 2nd story	Issued	10/11/2021	0.070				Asher Homes
BD-R-2021-00622	830 Iowa	+	Room addition with bathroom	Issued	10/27/2021	Renson	Joanne			Rogue Home Repair
BD-R-2020-00437	550 Allison	+	2nd story addtion	Final	7/29/2021		Matt	+		) Justin Caprari
BD-R-2021-00642	131 Church	+	Small bedroom/bath addition	Issued	172072021	Colwell	Coleen/Mike	 		Trivette Construction
SFR	131 Charch		Small beardonly bath addition	1250000		Colven	Colcentina		1/2//2021	Tivette constituction
BD-2017-01834	114 Granite		New SFR	Final	1/22/2020	Mastain	Mardi	114 Granite,	10/3/2017	Adroit Construction
DD D 2020 00464	254 N. J		N CED	Et al	2/26/2024	1 16	Dist.	Ashland	7/0/2020	D
BD-R-2020-00464	254 N. Laurel		New SFR	Final	3/26/2021	Landt	Rick		7/8/2020	By owner
BD-R-2021-00694	761 E. Main		2nd unit on lot	Issued	E /2.6 /2.02.4	Dallagiacomo-Rhodes	Carol	22415	9/27/2021	Coleman Creek
BD-R-2019-00295	126 W Fork		New SFR	Final	5/26/2021	Adderson Builders		234 Vista, Ashland	6/28/2019	David Scott Construction
BD-R-2020-00547	882 B Street		Demo & rebuild	Issued		Nible	Chris	ASHIGHG	12/10/2020	Ben The Builder
BD-R-2021-00700	241 Seventh		2nd unit on lot	Issued		Bar-Gem Vineyards				Integrity Building
BD-R-2020-00522	244 VanNess		Garage & workshop conversion to 2nd unit on lot	Final	11/19/2020		Eric	240 Van Ness		By Owner
BD-R-2020-00419	878 Siskiyou		2nd unit on lot	Final	4/19/2021		Doug			Better Built Const
MFR	,			•			<u> </u>	•		•
BD-R-2019-00308-BD-R-2019- 00307	158-166 N. Laurel	Т	2021 project-Not complete/ Duplex & manager unit	Re-submit and in review		Agakhanov	Vadim	262 B Street, Ashland	7/29/2019	SAME
BD-R-2020-00476	270 N Laurel		Remodel of apt building	Final	4/29/2021	Wallace	Randy	IV9IIIaiin	7/28/2020	Rogue Construction Art Inc
MIXED USE			The state of the s	, <u></u>	., = 0, = 0 = 1		11.00.1007		77 = 57 = 5	Thought contain dotto.
BD-MU-2020-00014	762 A Street		Commercial and living space	Issued	I	Cordova	Jodi	762 A street	10/20/2020	By owner
BD-MU-2020-00015	145 N. Main		Creating a residential unit inside. Exterior changes	Issued		Comte	Donn	175 Piedmont		By owner
BD-MU-2021-00018	143 N. First		Mixed Use - Plaza North	Issued		Plaza East LLC		815 Alder Creek	10/16/2019	Adroit Construction
BD-MU-2019-00010	185 Lithia Way		Mixed residential & commercial - Plaza East	Final	4/2/2021	Plaza East LLC		815 Alder Creek	10/16/2019	Adroit Construction
COMMERCIAL				•				. 5. 55.		
BD-NR-2021-00131	21 Winburn		Interior and exterior revisions for "Skout"	Final	3/8/2021	Beam	Tom/Lisa			4 Seasons Const
BD-NR-2018-00026 & BD-NR- 2019-00043	549 E. Main		Conversion of first floor SFR & detached cottages to hotel/motel	Final	1/29/2021	Gotshalk	Leonard	549 E. Main	2/1/2019	Ericksson Construction

<u>PastForward 2022</u> MAY 17, 2022

CIVIC										
			MAP Project - Dale Shostrom, Andy Stahlman							
INDIVIDUAL										
Julia & Hillary Davis	175 Church		Home clean up -Elec & Mech permits only			Tiny Mansion LLC		Nom by Cici Brow	'n	cicibrown615@gmail.com