

**CITY OF  
ASHLAND**  
**TREE COMMISSION - REGULAR MEETING**  
**March 4, 2021**  
**MINUTES - *Draft***

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Commission Chair Chris John called the meeting to order at 6:03 p.m. via Zoom

**Commissioners Present:**

Chris John  
Asa Cates  
Cat Gould  
Eric Simpson

**Council Liaison:**

Stephen Jensen, absent

**Park Liaison:**

Peter Baughman, absent

**Staff Present:**

Aaron Anderson: Associate Planner

**II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**A. Tree Commission regular meeting of February 4, 2021 regular meeting minutes.**

Commissioner Cates/Gould m/s to approve the minutes as presented. Voice Vote: ALL AYES. Motion passed.

**III. LIAISON REPORTS**

- Council Liaison - None
- Parks & Recreation Liaison - None
- Community Development Liaison

Aaron Anderson explained the Tree commission would give their annual report to the City Council during their meeting March 16, 2021. Chair John would not be available to provide the report. Commissioner Cates volunteered to give the report.

**IV. TYPE I REVIEWS**

**PLANNING ACTION: PA-T1-2021-00141**

**SUBJECT PROPERTY: 599 East Main Street**

**APPLICANT/OWNER: Rogue Planning & Development Services, LLC for Livni Family Trust (Gil Livni, *Trustee*)**

**DESCRIPTION: A request for Site Design Review approval to modify the existing building at 599 East Main Street including converting the former church to use as office space with occasional assembly uses (convention, trade show, etc.) and adding a new entry. The application also includes requests for a Conditional Use Permit as it involves the expansion of an existing non-conforming development where no off-street parking is available, and Street Tree Removal Permits to remove two Callery Pear street trees (10.2-inch DBH & 12.7-inch DBH) in the park row planting strip along East Main Street. COMPREHENSIVE PLAN**

**DESIGNATION: Commercial; ZONING: C-1; MAP: 39 1E 09AC; TAX LOT #: 7600**

Chair John read aloud the rules for electronic public hearings.

Staff explained the main element of the planning action was the request to remove two street trees. Amy Gunter spoke in favor of the application. Commissioner Simpson asked how tall the trees were and their health. Ms. Gunter responded the trees were approximately 20 to 25 feet tall. Neither had good form, the species was invasive, and one

tree had a pronounced lean. There was a power drop to the building. The overhead lines were on the other side of Main Street.

The public portion of the hearing was closed.

Commissioner Cates did not think the removal request met the criteria for street removal. He thought a shade tree would be a good replacement. Commissioner Gould agreed. They discussed appropriate tree species.

**Commissioner Cates/Gould m/s to approve the application as submitted with the following recommendations, that they plant a tree that is large stature at maturity with an appropriate caliper at least two inches at the time of planting, with the recommendation of planting a Red Flame Maple or Autumn Blaze Maple, or a Asocola tree, with appropriate irrigation. Voice Vote: ALL AYES. Motion passed.**

**PLANNING ACTION: PA-TREE-2021-00140**

**SUBJECT PROPERTY: Near 947 Mountain Meadows (Subject tree is located between two buildings)**

**OWNER: Mountain Meadows Parkside Condominium Association Inc**

**APPLICANT: Southern Oregon Tree Care**

**DESCRIPTION: A request for approval to remove one red maple (*Acer rubrum*) at Mountain Meadows. The application, prepared by an ISA certified arborist, indicates that the tree is 14"-DBH and stands approximately forty feet tall. The application explains that the tree is not well rooted based on the rocky nature of the ground, and that the height of the tree now exposes it to wind loads above the building. The concern is that a wind event may cause the tree to fail and potentially cause damage to the building. The application states the intent to mitigate the tree with a species better suited to the environment.**

**COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Health Care; ZONING: HC; MAP: 39 1E 04 AD; TAX LOT: 88000 & 40000**

The Commission discussed the request. Many of them were unable to locate the subject tree due to the number of trees between the buildings. There were no photos of the subject tree. The arborist report stated the tree was healthy. The application had indicated the area would be relandscaped. Chair John was not prepared to approve the removal.

**Commissioner Gould/John m/s to deny the application based on the lack of evidence or an ability to locate the subject tree. Voice Vote: ALL AYES. Motion passed.**

**PLANNING ACTION: PA-TREE-2021-00142**

**SUBJECT PROPERTY 549 B St.**

**OWNER/APPLICANT: Robert Lombardi**

**DESCRIPTION: A request for approval to remove two Black Locust trees (*robinia pseudoacacia L.*) at the property located at 549 B Street. The application includes a report prepared by an ISA certified arborist, indicates that the trees are 43" and 24". The application explains that the trees are both in poor health with splitting branches posing a hazard to the surrounding development. COMPREHENSIVE PLAN**

**DESIGNATION: Employment; ZONING: E-1; MAP: 39 1E 09 AB; TAX LOT: 6301**

Mr. Anderson explained the arborist wanted an emergency removal, but the hazard would be mitigated by pruning the broken branch. Commissioner Cates had conducted a site visit and the trees did not appear healthy. Chair John stated the crown was mostly dead and the tree had previously been cabled. Commissioner Gould thought the tree should be removed.

**Commissioner Cates/Simpson m/s to approve the application with the suggestion a mitigation tree be planted if appropriate. Voice Vote: ALL AYES. Motion passed.**

**PLANNING ACTION: PA-TREE-2021-00143**

**SUBJECT PROPERTY: 311 Ravenwood Place**

**OWNER: Larry and Ann Anderson**

**APPLICANT: Rosemary Murpree / Ravenwood Townhouses HOA**

**DESCRIPTION: A request for approval to remove a single black oak at the rear of unit 311 at the Ravenwood Estates. The application includes a brief report by an ISA certified arborist and includes photos of the base of the tree showing an area of significant root rot and decay. The leans significantly over the building posing a hazard to the structure in the event of main stem failure. COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:**

**Multifamily Residential; ZONING: R-2; MAP: 39 1E 09 BD; TAX LOT: 13300**

Commissioner Cates stated the decay at the base was obvious. The Black Oak trees were strong, but the two adjacent White Oak trees would benefit from the removal. Rosemary Murpree clarified the request would remove both trunks.

**Commissioner John/Simpson m/s to approve the application as submitted. Voice Vote: ALL AYES. Motion passed.**

**PLANNING ACTION: PA-TREE-2021-00144**

**SUBJECT PROPERTY: Tax Lot 6100, Oak Knoll Dr.**

**OWNER/APPLICANT: Frank and Kathleen Millett**

**DESCRIPTION: A request for approval to remove two large oak trees and one large pine on a vacant residential parcel on Oak Knoll Drive. The application includes a site plan showing the proposed residence and ARU location showing that the proposed structures encroach significantly into the critical root zone of the trees necessitating their removal. COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Single-Family Residential; ZONING: R-1-10; MAP: 39 1E 14 AD; TAX LOT: 6100**

Mr. Anderson provided background on the application. Not removing the trees created a significant restriction for the applicants. Alternately, the application material was not robust and lacked an arborist report.

Commissioner Cates stated the Black Oak was in good form and appeared very healthy. The White Oak was a beautiful specimen. Commissioner Gould added the pine was beautiful as well. The Commission and staff further discussed the application. The application made no attempt to preserve any of the trees.

**Commissioner Cates/Gould m/s to deny the application as submitted on the basis that the site plan was too vague and hypothetical to approve the removal of three significant trees. Voice Vote: ALL AYES. Motion passed.**

## **V. TYPE II REVIEWS**

**PLANNING ACTION: PA-T2-2021-00028**

**SUBJECT PROPERTY: 364 Walker Avenue (Walker Elementary School)**

**APPLICANT/OWNER: HMK Company for the Ashland School District**

**DESCRIPTION: The Planning Commission will conduct an initial public hearing to review details of the proposal and take public comments on a request for Site Design Review approval for a 22,450 square foot, single-story addition to Walker Elementary School at 364 Walker Avenue. As part of the proposal, the parking lot and drop-off lane would be relocated and expanded, with access to be taken via Hunter Court (the driveway serving Hunter Park) and a new courtyard would be created. The application also includes requests for a Conditional Use Permit to modify the School District's Master Sign Permit Program (PA#2012-00899) to allow new signage for Walker Elementary School in conjunction with the proposed addition, and Tree Removal Permits to remove 20 trees. An existing 9,700 square foot classroom will be demolished in conjunction with the proposal. No final decision will be made at this initial public hearing; the item will come back to the Planning Commission for a decision at the April 13, 2021 meeting. COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Single Family Residential; ZONING: R-1-5; MAP: 39 1E 10; TAX LOT #: 3600**

Kerry KenCairn explained the plans before the Commission were not the most recent ones and did not show the current

design. It would not be appropriate to review the application at this time.

The item was postponed until the next Tree Commission meeting April 8, 2021. Ms. KenCairn would draft a letter for the Planning Commission.

**Commissioner Gould left the meeting at 7:08 p.m.**

**VI. STREET TREE REMOVAL PERMITS – None**

**VII. OLD BUSINESS**

**VIII. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

Mr. Anderson introduced Tony Mecum from the City of Grants Pass Urban Tree Advisory Committee.

Tree of the Year

Mr. Anderson discussed the Tree of the Year nominations and launching the voting phase. Since the Commission lacked a quorum, he would follow up with each commissioner individually. They went on to discuss the nominations.

Wild Life handout

Mr. Anderson briefly shared the handout with Community Development Director Bill Molnar. Mr. Molnar's initial thoughts was concern citing federal law that the City was not able to enforce. He emphasized reviewing the powers and duties section for the Tree Commission in the Ashland Municipal Code. Mr. Anderson would meet with Mr. Molnar to get further direction regarding contents.

**IX. ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting adjourned at 7:27 p.m.

**Next Meeting:** April 8, 2021