

**ASHLAND HISTORIC COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Minutes**

October 4, 2017

**Community Development/Engineering Services Building – 51 Winburn Way – Siskiyou Room**

**CALL TO ORDER:**

Commission Chair, Shostrom called the meeting to order at 6:02 in the Siskiyou Room at the Community Development and Engineering Offices located at 51 Winburn Way, Ashland OR 97520.

<b>Commissioners Present:</b>	<b>Council Liaison:</b>
Shostrom	Rich Rosenthal-Absent
Emery	<b>Staff Present:</b>
Giordano	Maria Harris; Planning Dept.
Swink	Regan Trapp; Secretary
Von Chamier	Fotini Kaufman; Planning Dept.
Whitford	
<b>Commissioners Absent:</b>	Skibby
	Leonard

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

Von Chamier motioned to approve minutes from September 6, 2017. Whitford seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed.

**PUBLIC FORUM:**

There was no one in the audience wishing to speak.

**COUNCIL LIAISON REPORT:**

Rosenthal was absent so no report was given.

Shostrom gave the procedure for public hearings to the audience.

**PLANNING ACTION REVIEW:**

**PLANNING ACTION:** PA- 2017-01294

**SUBJECT PROPERTY:** 128 Central Avenue

**APPLICANT:** Rogue Planning & Development Services

**OWNERS:** Robert Baldwin

**DESCRIPTION:** A request for Site Design Review for an eight-unit multi-family development for the property located at 128 Central Avenue. The existing house contains two units. The proposal has been revised to add five units at the rear of the property and one unit above the reconstructed garage at the front of the property. The application also includes requests for a Conditional Use Permit to exceed the Maximum Permitted Floor Area in the Skidmore Academy Historic District by 21 percent (985 square feet) and for a Tree Removal Permit to remove seven trees six-inches in diameter-at-breast-height or greater. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** High Density Multi-Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-3; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 04CC; **TAX LOT:** 4500.

Von Chamier stated that her office is working on the project.

Von Chamier recused herself.

Harris gave the staff report for PA-2017-01294.

Shostrom opened the public hearing to the applicants.

Amy Gunter, Rogue Planning and Development, 1424 S. Ivy Street, Medford, OR, addressed the Commission regarding the project. Ms. Gunter discussed such things as plate height of the structures, tree preservation and location of the utilities. She went on to say that their plans have changed but feel these cottages will match with the character of the neighborhood.

Lois Van Aken, neighbor, residing at, 140 Central Ave, Ashland, OR, addressed the Commission regarding the project. Ms. Van Aken stated that parking is an issue and will not accommodate everyone. She appreciates that they are saving the Ponderosa Pine but feels the new plan isn't any better and the two story unit above the garage will be an eyesore due to massing. Ms. Van Aken would like to see a one story cottage in place of the garage instead and doesn't understand why the applicant would be leaving some trees on the property that are dying or "ill-placed". She went on to say, that she would like the applicant to keep within the maximum permitted floor area for the historic district.

**Ms. Gunter rebuttal time:**

Ms. Gunter stated that traffic impact analysis is not required and parking is provided to the numbers as per the land use code. She went on to say that there is room for two bikes within the garage and they will also install bike racks. The property is below the allowed density underlined in the land use code and the massing of the structure will not overpower any adjacent properties.

Shostrom closed the public hearing and opened to the Commission for comments.

Whitford motioned to approve PA-2017-01294 with recommendations. Shostrom seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed

**Recommendations of Historic Commission for PA-2017-01294:**

The Historic Commission believes the scale and massing of the five proposed units at the rear of the property is similar to buildings along the alley. In addition, the Commission appreciates the applicant's efforts to save the large ponderosa pine on the west side of the property by moving one of the proposed units above the garage at the front of the property. Other benefits of the proposal to move a unit over the garage that the Commission recognizes area decrease in added impervious surface and increased landscaping.

The Commission is concerned with the proposed new garage/one-unit structure located at the front of the property meeting the Historic District Design Standards requiring a height and scale comparable to the range of building heights and sizes in the immediate vicinity (AMC 18.4.2.050.B.2 and 3). Specifically, the proposed structure appears to compete with the historic home and surrounding buildings. The Commission recommends approval of the application with a condition that the plans for the new structure are revised to address the following items.

**1. Recommendations for the new garage/one-unit structure:**

- Reduce the height of the structure by four feet.
- Move the proposed garage/one-unit structure at least four to six feet behind (north of) the front façade of the historic home.
- Add trellis with 3 knee braces and a beam above the garage doors to soften the vertical height.
- Consider flipping the second story deck to the west side of the new second-story unit.

**2. Recommendations for the five units proposed at the rear of the property.**

- Use smooth siding, not textured hardieplank.
- Add 3 to 4-inch framing between single hung windows.
- Do not use white windows.
- Increase size of porch posts to larger than 4 x 4 – wrap 4 x 4 or use 6 x 6.
- Use decorative or flat balustrade on porch railing of new units, do not use proposed 2 x 2.

**PLANNING ACTION:** PA- 2017-01310  
**SUBJECT PROPERTY:** 981 Siskiyou Blvd.  
**OWNERS:** MH Smith Inc  
**APPLICANT:** MNM Fund LLC

**DESCRIPTION:** A request for Site Design Review and Tree Removal Permit approval for a three-unit multi-family residential development for the property located at 981 Siskiyou Blvd. The proposal includes retaining the existing residence and constructing two units at the rear of the property. The Tree Removal Permit request is to remove two trees to the west of the existing home including a maple and an ash tree.  
**COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** Low-Density Multi-Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-2;  
**ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 09DA; **TAX LOT:** 8100.

There was no ex-parte contact or conflict of interest indicated by the Commission.

Harris gave the staff report for PA-2017-01310.

Shostrom opened the public hearing to the applicants.

Amy Gunter, Rogue Planning and Development, 1424 S. Ivy Street, Medford, OR, and Melanie Smith, owner, 535 W. Nevada Street, Ashland, OR, addressed the Commission regarding the project. Ms. Gunter commented that the square footage has been reduced and the office area has been removed. She conveyed that single hung windows have been added as well. Ms. Smith noted that a full landscape plan was submitted and a survey is in the process of being taken care of. They pointed out that the trash enclosure area will be moved to the back of property.

Dominic Smith, neighbor, residing at 965 Siskiyou Boulevard addressed the Commission regarding the project. Mr. Smith wants to ensure that the tree is protected during the construction project and would like the applicant to install a fence to the front of the property blocking the pedestrian pathway.

Shostrom closed the public hearing and opened to the Commission for comments.

**Recommendations of Historic Commission for PA-2017-01310:**

The Historic Commission appreciates the significant changes to the design of the proposed new structure including the decrease in height and mass by reducing the volume of the second story, addition of architectural details such as a water table and belly band and change to double hung windows. The Commission recommends approval of the application with a condition that the plans for the new structure are revised to address the following items.

- For dormers, use same symmetrical roof shape and pitch, floor levels and plate heights (Roof AMC 18.4.2.050.B.6).
- To improve the sense of entry, increase porch depth, add eyebrow roof with knee braces over each front door, and add partition wall on porch between units (Entrances AMC 18.4.2.050.B.10).
- Use composition single or metal roofing. Color of roofing shall not be very bright primary or neon – type paint colors in accordance with AMC 18.4.2.030.E.

Shostrom motioned to approve PA-2017-01310 with recommendations. Swink seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed.

**PLANNING ACTION:** PA- 2017-01605  
**SUBJECT PROPERTY:** 147 Van Ness Avenue  
**OWNERS:** Deborah Dryden & Robert Hirschboeck  
**APPLICANT:** Conscious Construction

**DESCRIPTION:** A request for Site Design Review for a three-unit multi-family development for the property located at 147 Van Ness Avenue. The proposal includes the existing residence as one unit, the conversion of an existing guest cottage as a second unit and the construction of a new third unit with attached single vehicle garage off of the alley. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** High Density Multi-Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-3; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 04CC; **TAX LOT:** 2900.

There was no ex-parte contact or conflict of interest indicated by the Commission.

Harris gave the staff report for PA-2017-01417.

Shostrom opened the public hearing to the applicants.

Jason Eaton, applicant, residing at 957 Bellview Ave, Ashland, OR and Amy Gunter, Rogue Planning and Development, 1424 S. Ivy Street, Medford, OR, addressed the Commission regarding this project. Ms. Gunter stated that there is a broad range of homes being built in this neighborhood and the property is occupied by a non-historic, non-contributing “ranch style” structure. Ms. Gunter showed photos of properties near the project and types of designs in the area. **(Exhibit A, attached)** The design is compatible in height and not substantially larger than other structures in the area. Ms. Gunter went on to say that the proposed structure is “West Coast Modern” and consistent with 1940’s architectural styles – Low pitch roof, angular design and modern materials.

Shostrom closed the public hearing and opened to the Commission for comments.

The Historic Commission recommends approving the application as submitted. The more modern design works with the mix of architecture in the vicinity, as well as being situated at the rear of the property.

Giordano motioned to approve PA-2017-01417 as presented. Von Chamier seconded. Voice vote; All AYES. Motion passed.

**NEW ITEMS:**

- Review board schedule.
- Project assignments for planning actions

**DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

There were no items to discuss.

**COMMISSION ITEMS NOT ON AGENDA:**

There were no items to discuss.

**OLD BUSINESS:**

There were no items to discuss.

**Review Board Schedule**

October 5 <sup>th</sup>	Terry, Keith, Sam
October 12 <sup>th</sup>	Terry, Sam, Piper
October 19 <sup>th</sup>	Terry, Taylor, Tom
October 26 <sup>th</sup>	Terry, Dale, Bill
November 2 <sup>nd</sup>	Terry, Piper, Sam
November 9 <sup>th</sup>	Terry, Keith, Bill

**Project Assignments for Planning Actions**

PA-2015-01695	399 Beach	Skibby
PA-2016-00847	252 B Street	Whitford
PA-2016-01027	276 B Street	Shostrom & Leonard
PA-2016-02103	133 Alida	Swink
PA-2016-02095	563 Rock St.	Whitford
PA-2016-02114	556 B	Von Chamier
PA-2017-00013	15, 35, 44 & 51 S. Pioneer Street	ALL
PA-2017-00235	114 Granite	Leonard

PA-2017-00325	746 C Street	Von Chamier
PA-2017-00200	165 Water	ALL
PA-2017-00707	550 E. Main	Skibby
PA-2017-00838	250 Alta Ave	Emery
PA- 2017-01054	220 Hargadine	Shostrom & Whitford
PA-2017-00969	244 Hargadine	Shostrom & Whitford
PA-2017-01279	692 B Street	Leonard
PA-2017-01294	128 Central	Emery & Swink
PA-2017-01417	228 B Street	Whitford
PA-2017-01310	981 Siskiyou Blvd	Shostrom
PA-2017-01649	84 Dewey Street	Von Chamier
PA- 2017-01605	147 Van Ness	Emery

**ANNOUNCEMENTS & INFORMATIONAL ITEMS:**

Next meeting is scheduled November 8, 2017 at 6:00 pm

*There being no other items to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:16 pm*

Respectfully submitted by Regan Trapp

# Exhibit A

Comparable roof forms / Massing / Scale

Existing Residence – 147 Van Ness



# Exhibit A

Existing guest house at 147 Van Ness (to be converted).



Exhibit A



# Exhibit A

N/S alley facing South



Exhibit A

170 Central (alley view)



Exhibit A



Exhibit A



Exhibit A



Exhibit A



Exhibit A



Exhibit A

179 Van Ness



117 Helman

Exhibit A



Exhibit A



Exhibit A



## Exhibit A

“West Coast Modern House” by Greg Bellerby 2015 Celebrates, west coast modern architecture from the 1940s – 1970s.



Exhibit A

