



CITY OF ASHLAND



TREE COMMISSION MINUTES (Minutes are in order of presenters) October 11, 2018

| | |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------|
| Commissioners Present: | Parks Liaison |
| Christopher John | Peter Baughman |
| Russell Neff | |
| Asa Cates | Staff Present: |
| | Nathan Emerson |
| Council Liaison | |
| Steven Jensen - Absent | |

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Christopher John called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. in the Siskiyou Room of the Community Development and Engineering Services Building located at 51 Winburn Way.

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Neff/Cates m/s to approve the minutes of September 6, 2018 meeting. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.

III. ANNOUNCEMENTS & LIAISON REPORTS

- Council Liaison
 - Council Liaison was not present to give report.
- Parks & Recreation Liaison
 - Baughman reported that the Parks Department purchased a roughly 5-acre lot on East Main Street near Clay to be utilized for a 2nd dog park.
- Community Development Liaison
 - Emerson stated that there was nothing to report from Community Development.

IV. PUBLIC FORUM

There was no one in the audience wishing to speak.

V. DISCUSSION

Oregon Shakespeare Festival Oak Tree Replacement

Ted DeLong of the Oregon Shakespeare Festival came to seek advice on the replacement of a Canyon Live Oak, that has died, on the Bricks at Oregon Shakespeare Festival. Mr. DeLong brought a handout with several options being considered. **(See exhibit A)**

The Commission discussed several options with Mr. DeLong, including a Willow Oak. A replacement Canyon Live Oak was considered, but the tree is considered hard to transplant and survival would not be guaranteed.

VI. TYPE I REVIEWS

PLANNING ACTION: TREE-2018-00021

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 898 Morton St

APPLICANT: Kerry Kencairn

OWNER: Ryan Schnobrich

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Tree Removal Permit to remove two trees from the property located at 898 Morton Street. Both trees are Ponderosa pines between approximately 14 and 17 inches diameter at breast height (dbh) and over 40 feet tall. The property is steeply sloped and located in the Hillside Lands overlay. The trees were slated to be retained in the original subdivision approval. The application materials provided include a statement from the Fire Adapted Communities Coordinator recommending the removal of the trees because of their proximity to the existing house and deck.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Rural Residential; **ZONING:** RR-.5; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 16AC; **TAX LOT:** 421

Emerson gave staff report on TREE-2018-00021.

TREE-2018-00021 was a continuance from the previous month's meeting. The trees were considered for removal and recommended for denial.

Kerry Kencairn of 545 A' Street, applicant's representative, spoke to the Commission about this planning action. Ms. Kencairn, impressed upon the fact that the amount of tree left after pruning up the recommended 10ft from the structure would leave one side nearly denuded. Ms. Kencairn contends that the trees start 10ft below the finished floor level of the home and are too close to the house and believes it would be impractical to prune the trees so severely and leave them. Ms. Kencairn is requesting removal of the two trees and would like to see the Commission mitigate for the planting of more trees, rather than try to keep pruning and topping something that would be a match head just because of an ordinance.

Dan Dawson, a member of the Wildfire Mitigation Commission for the City Ashland, addressed the Commission. As part of the Wildfire Commission, he was interested in attending and determining how the Tree Commission processed applications and expressed his interest in working together for the to make Ashland a "fire safe" community. Mr. Dawson stated that he was making no recommendation on this planning action and attended the meeting to urge the Tree Commission to take into account fire hazards and the recent ordinances passed on wildfires. He went on to say that the Wildfire Mitigation Commission will make every effort to try and send a representative to every Tree Commission meeting to work through potential conflicts.

Tom Besich, neighbor, residing at, 880 Morton, spoke on the application. Mr. Besich recalls one of the Commissioners at the previous meeting stating that "the trees under consideration were the most fire resistant on the property". Mr. Besich wanted the Tree Commission to consider requiring other trees on the property not related to the action be kept. Mr. Besich believes the owners want to build a deck, to which he has no objection. Mr. Besich's suggestion would be to keep some smaller Fir Trees that are 25-30ft tall that would not pose a threat to the property.

John discussed his concerns about setting a precedent for trees being removed for fire hazard. John questioned if a mature Conifer next to a house was automatically a fire hazard? John wondered if it would have been more appropriate to have treated the tree as a Non-Hazard removal instead of basing it on a fuels reduction.

Cates/John m/s to approve with the recommendation of mitigating with fire resistant species in a suitable location. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.

PLANNING ACTION: TREE-2018-00031

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 166 N Laurel St

APPLICANT/OWNER: Vadim Agakhanov

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Street Tree Removal Permit to remove a tree located on the alley

between 166 N Laurel and 148 N Laurel St. The tree is a 12 inch DBH Juniper approximately 20 feet in height. The tree is damaging the foundation of a structure and leaning out over the alleyway.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Low Density Multi-Family; **ZONING:** R-2;

ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 04CC; **TAX LOT:** 3400

Emerson gave staff report for TREE-2018-00031.

Vadim Agakhanov, owner and applicant, was present and conveyed that the tree is a hazard and is damaging the foundation of the home.

After a brief discussion, the Commission rendered their decision.

*John/Neff m/s to **approve** as submitted. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.*

PLANNING ACTION: PA-T2-2018-00003

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 188 Garfield Street

APPLICANT: Rogue Planning & Development Services, LLC

OWNER: Spartan Ashland Rivergate Real Estate, LLC

DESCRIPTION: A request for Site Design Review approval to construct a 72-unit studio apartment community ("The MidTown Lofts") for the properties located at 188 Garfield Street. The application also includes requests for a Tree Removal Permit to remove 15 trees that are more than six-inches in diameter at breast height (d.b.h.); an Exception to the Site Development and Design Standards to treat storm water run-off in a combination of bio-swales, underground treatment facilities and detentions ponds rather than in landscaped parking lot medians and swales; and for Exceptions to Street Standards to retain the existing curbside sidewalk system along the frontage of the property and for the location of the driveway curb cut on Quincy Street, which is proposed to be shared with the property to the east and which would exceed the maximum driveway curb cut width for residential developments. (All of the proposed units are studio units that are less than 500 square feet in gross habitable floor area and each counts as $\frac{3}{4}$ of a unit for purposes of density calculation; density bonuses are requested for conservation housing, outdoor recreation space and major recreation facilities.)

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: High Density Multi-Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-3;

ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 15AD; **TAX LOT:** 2100 & 2101

Emerson gave the staff report for PA-T2-2018-00003.

The applicants were represented by Amy Gunter of Rogue Planning and Development Services, 33 N. Central Suite 213 in Medford, and Allen Pardee, of Covy-Pardee Landscape Architects. Ms. Gunter handed out a site plan showing the proposed layout and open spaces. **(Exhibit B)**. Ms. Gunter gave an overview of the project, including their calculations of open space and density and explained which trees are intended to be saved and which are not. Ms. Gunter went on to say, that the applicants have asked for an exception to design standards to move a sidewalk to save street trees. Ms. Gunter also gave a short history on the past planning actions on the property to remove trees. Mr. Pardee gave further clarification on the trees selected for removal and what happened with the past tree removals that were approved.

Mary Scott, neighbor, residing at, 1274 Iowa, addressed the Commission regarding the proposal. Ms. Scott expressed her concerns about the past tree removals, feeling that they had been done poorly and that the lot had not been well maintained. Ms. Scott was also concerned about the design of the project, what was being counted as recreational space, and the density being maximized on the lot.

Mr. Pardee acknowledged that trees on the lot had been under watered since the lot had been sold and the original structure demolished. He stated that the property owner had since purchased a water truck to ensure trees are adequately watered. After brief questioning by the Commission, Pardee confirmed that the neighbor's black locusts would be protected.

Cates asked who would deal with trees removed without permits and Emerson conveyed it would be

the Code Enforcement Specialist for the City of Ashland that would take care of them. Cates also inquired about tree #8, a mulberry, stating that it could be saved if a sidewalk was angled away from it. Mr. Pardee emphasized that it could be saved, but that would go against design standards and his own preference to remove what he considered to be a lower quality tree. Mr. Pardee stressed that moving the sidewalk even 6ft would leave it well under the canopy and would need to be a design exception.

John asked how many new trees would be planted and Ms. Gunter answered that there would be a total of 36 new tree plantings.

Ms. Scott, neighbor, spoke again, noting that there were other issues she had with the project, including parking and the total density of the lot.

Cates explained that the purview of the Tree Commission was not density or the open space. In the discussion a month prior it was stated that the Planning Commission had decided to continue the hearing and that citizens could attend that meeting and address other concerns there.

*John/Cates m/s to **approve** with the recommendation that every effort be made to preserve existing trees, that they be pruned professionally, and that synthetic turf not be used. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.*

PLANNING ACTION: PA-T2-2018-00004

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 1661 Ashland Street

APPLICANT: Rogue Credit Union & Columbia Care Services, Inc.

OWNER: Columbia Care Services, Inc./Jerome White, KSW Architects

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Land Partition and Site Design Review to create three parcels from the parent property located at 1661 Ashland Street. Parcel 1 would be 33,278 square feet in area and would contain the proposed "Rogue Ridge" development consisting of 30 multi-family dwelling units including one resident manager's unit and 29 affordable housing units in a 26,146 square foot, three-story building in two connected wings; Parcel 2 would be 9,913 square feet in area and would contain a future two-story commercial building; and the third parcel would be 22,462 square feet and would contain the existing Rogue Credit Union building. (25 of the 30 proposed units are studio units that are less than 500 square feet in gross habitable floor area and each counts as $\frac{3}{4}$ of a unit for purposes of density calculation; the five remaining units are two- and three-bedroom and count as full units for density purposes.)

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Commercial; **ZONING:** C-1;

ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 10DC; **TAX LOT:** 8700 & 9201

Emerson gave staff report on PA-T2-2018-00004.

Kerry Kencairn, 545 A' Street, applicant's representative, addressed the Commission regarding this project. She gave a high level overview of the project and explained the reason for removal and went over the plans for updated landscaping that would add an additional 16 trees.

*Cates/Neff m/s to **approve** as submitted. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.*

PLANNING ACTION: TREE-2018-00029

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 899 Cypress Point Loop

APPLICANT/OWNER: Geoffrey Ball

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Hazardous Tree Removal Permit to remove a black oak located in the Oak Knoll subdivision open space but functioning as part of the backyard at 899 Cypress Point Loop. The tree, approximately 40 inches diameter at breast height, was recommended for removal by two arborists and found to have root disease, rot, fungus, and die off.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Single Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-1-10; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 13CB; **TAX LOT:** 5300

The applicants were not present.

Emerson gave a staff report on TREE-2018-00029, explaining that the tree is partially in the open space and thus requires a tree removal permit.

John noted the tree was a “spectacular” tree and it is very unfortunate that the tree has declined. He noted two arborists had looked at the tree and both considered it a hazard.

The Commission discussed how overwatering had likely contributed to the decline of the tree and caused some of the rot and fungus problems.

*Cates/Neff m/s to **approve** with the recommendation that the tree be replaced with a large stature tree such as a willow oak or other oak recommended by an arborist. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.*

VII. STREET TREES

PLANNING ACTION: TREE-2018-00027

SUBJECT PROPERTY: Right of Way at intersection of Scenic and Grandview

APPLICANT/OWNER: City of Ashland Streets Division

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Hazardous Tree Removal Permit to remove a volunteer tree that is damaging the curb. The tree has multiple 6 inch stems and an approximate height of 30 feet. It is near 195 Scenic Drive. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** Single Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-1-10;

Emerson gave the staff report on TREE-2018-00027.

Cates/John m/s to **approve** as submitted. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.

PLANNING ACTION: TREE-2018-00028

SUBJECT PROPERTY: Right of Way at intersection of Orchard and Westwood St

APPLICANT/OWNER: City of Ashland Electric Department

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Street Tree Removal Permit to remove a dead tree at the intersection of Orchard and Westwood Street. The tree is approximately 30 inches in diameter at breast height and 70 feet tall. The tree is located approximately between 460 and 450 Orchard St.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Single Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-1-10;

Emerson gave the staff report on TREE-2018-00028.

*John/Neff m/s to **approve** as submitted. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.*

PLANNING ACTION: TREE-2018-00030

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 365 Strawberry Ln

APPLICANT: Regenesi Ecological Design

OWNER: William Potts

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Street Tree Removal Permit to remove a tree in the right of way at 365 Strawberry Ln. The tree is a 10 inch DBH lodgepole pine that is approximately 20 feet in height. The tree is on an eroding cut slope and has exposed structural roots. In order to accommodate further foundation drainage improvements further root cutting is required.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Rural Residential; **ZONING:** RR-.5;

ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 08AC; **TAX LOT:** 602

Emerson gave a staff report on TREE-2018-00030.

The Commission discussed having some difficulty locating the trees on the property.

*John/Cates m/s to **approve** as submitted. Voice Vote. All AYES. Motion passed.*

VIII. DISCUSSION PART 2

Tree Removal and Landscape updates to Public Parking Lot at 130 N Pioneer St.

Emerson gave a short explanation of the proposal. City Council has directed Public Works to mitigate concerns for a neighbor by re-landscaping. Senior staff determined that there is no permit required for removal, as trees on public property under 18 inches DBH are exempt from removal.

John noted that he liked the planting list and Cates approved of the replanting of large stature trees that have been proposed. Cates did not believe the project would have a large impact on tree canopies in the vicinity.

Commissioners mentioned that this property has come up before, but that the previous proposal would have seen many more trees in different locations removed.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:05 p.m. Emerson noted that the next regular meeting would be held on Thursday, November 8, 2018 at 6:00 pm in the Siskiyou Room of the Community Development Building at 51 Winburn Way.

Respectfully submitted by Regan Trapp