

**MINUTES FOR REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING
ASHLAND PARKS & RECREATION COMMISSION
April 14, 2021
Electronic Meeting – 6:00 p.m.**

Present: Commissioners Gardiner (Chair), Landt (Vice-Chair), Eldridge, Lewis; Director Black; Recreation Superintendent Dials; Senior Services Superintendent Glatt, Assistant Sullivan.

Absent: Commissioner Bell

This meeting was recorded by RVTV. The recording can be found on the [City of Ashland video archive](#).

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m.

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APRC Study Session – February 3, 2021

Motion: Landt moved to approve the minutes with the following changes. Seconded by Lewis.

Pg. 7, The fifth bullet down should read: "Natural gas heaters typically last 6 – 8 years..." rather than "68 years"

Vote: The vote was all yes

APRC Regular Business Meeting – February 10, 2021

Landt stated the minutes correctly reflect the motion made regarding the Calle Guanajuato. One of the stipulations in the motion stated, "Space allocation for the 2021 season will revert to 2019 unless the APRC Commissioners change the policy." The intent of the motion was to state that the 2022 season, rather than 2021, would revert back to 2019. Commissioners will correct the motion from February 10, 2021 to reflect the intent of the motion under Unfinished Business.

Motion: Landt moved to approve the minutes and to make note on the official correction to the motion to state: "Space allocation for the 2022 season will revert to 2019 unless the APRC Commissioners change the policy" and to approve the minutes, which will state the correction made to the motion. Seconded by Lewis.

Vote: The vote was all yes

APRC Study Session – March 7, 2021 and APRC Regular Business Meeting – March 14, 2021

Motion: Landt moved to approve the minutes as presented. Seconded by Eldridge.

Vote: The vote was all yes

III. ADDITIONS OR DELETIONS TO THE AGENDA

Gardiner pulled item #3, "HUB" Sculpture at Railroad Park Design Approval, from the consent agenda for open discussion and action under Unfinished Business

IV. PUBLIC FORUM

None

V. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Subcommittee Minutes Acknowledgment
 - Ashland Senior Advisory Committee (ASAC) – January 11, 2021
2. Ashland Senior Advisory Committee (ASAC) Member Appointment
3. "HUB" Sculpture at Railroad Park Design Approval

Motion: Landt moved to acknowledge item number 1 and 2 on the Consent Agenda. Seconded by Lewis.

Vote: The vote was all yes

VI. DIRECTORS REPORT

Black reported on the following items:

Japanese Garden

- Progress on the garden continues, which includes the construction of a cinder block wall along the front of the garden. The wall is an original component of the plan. This wall will be skim coated and roof tiles will be installed on the top of the wall. The wall is consistent with traditional Japanese garden design
- Black stated he will facilitate tours of the Japanese Garden with Commissioners in groups so a public meeting will not need to be held. Holding a public meeting in the garden is not possible because of safety issues

Wildfire Fuel Reduction Activity

- Black stated APRC is working in conjunction with Ashland Fire and Rescue to reduce wildfire fuels on APRC properties that have been identified as containing significant amounts on blackberries
- The work is being done on APRC properties located along Bear Creek, including the Riverwalk/Mace Property, areas adjacent to Verde Village, and the Nature Center
 - The Nature Center Manager will be conducting studies to track revegetation efforts

Budget Updates

- The Citizen's Budget Committee is in the process of reviewing the City of Ashland Budget as well as the APRC Budget. They met on April 13
- The City Manager and the Finance Director represented the APRC budget at the meeting and questions were raised by committee members that may lead to Director Black and Chair Gardiner attending a future meeting to directly answer questions of the committee

VII. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

1. "HUB" Sculpture at Railroad Park Design Approval (pulled from the consent agenda)

Black stated the proposal for this sculpture came to the Parks Commission on March 25, 2019. Parks Commissioners approved the installation of the sculpture at Railroad Park. The process of choosing an artist and presenting a design is managed by the Public Arts Commission (PAC). The PAC is bringing the issue back to the Parks Commission to present the design and seek final approval to placement in the Railroad Park. The attached [staff report](#) will go to the City Council for final approval and inclusion in the City of Ashland public art inventory. Black introduced City of Ashland staff liaison to the PAC, Aaron Anderson, and PAC Chair Andy Stallman to provide additional information. Jennifer Corio, the artists who created the sculpture, was present and had some technical difficulties joining the meeting at the beginning of the discussion.

- Anderson reviewed the history of an art installation project in the railroad district called "Marking Ashland Places" or MAP as outlined in the staff report, which includes the "HUB" sculpture to be located in Railroad Park.
- Details of the story telling vignette that will be included on the sculpture are still in the works and will be discussed at the upcoming PAC meeting on Friday, April 16, 2021
- Stallman noted that the Golden Spike will include Chinese characters on the backside that will acknowledge the Chinese workers who built the railroad and that the overall purpose of the installation is to note the change that the railroad brought to Ashland
- In response to a question from Landt, Stallman clarified that the area immediately surrounding the sculpture will be landscaped rather than hardscaped
- Landt asked how much thought was given to the timing and perception to introduce the sculpture into the park at the same time there is a temporary art installation on the fence in the same park that has not received a permanent installation although that has been called for. An in-depth discussion on this topic begins at [33:21 in the video that has been posted online](#). A short summary of comments is listed below.
 - Stallman reviewed the history of this particular project, which began in 2019 and sees the HUB project and Say Their Names as separate art installations
 - Landt voted for and supports the HUB artwork, but is concerned that the Say Their Names installation has not been provided permanent installation and is concerned that moving forward at this time could be considered tone deaf
 - Black stated the following factors could be considered when thinking of both projects

- The HUB sculpture had already received approval for to be located in the park prior to the Say Their Names installation was put on the fence
- The fence where the Say Their Names installation is currently located may not end up being the home of a permanent installation
- The HUB sculpture acknowledges the history associated with Railroad Park
- Gardiner stated that the Peace Wall came into existence through a grass roots efforts and was installed in the Railroad District and became a permanent art installation located in front of the Library and that this particular project may end up being located elsewhere
- Anderson estimated that the fall of 2021 would be the earliest that the HUB sculpture could be installed. Corio later affirmed this estimate
- Eldridge acknowledged coming onto the Parks Commission at the tail end of this process and stated concern with placing art that glorifies industry, fossil fuel burning and the displacement of native people in the same physical location of the community response to the Black Lives Matter movement and that there are certain aspects of history that should not be glorified through art or monuments
- Lewis stated the HUB sculpture is a large project that includes the PAC and the Historic Commission and highlights an aspect of Ashland history. Lewis added that the message should get out to the community that there is support for a permanent Say Their Names installation and that details of what that looks like can be worked out with the organizers. Lewis stated support for moving forward with the approval of the HUB sculpture
- Stallman added that the Say Their Name organizers will present to the PAC for the first time at the upcoming Friday meeting
- Corio was able to join the meeting and stated research with local experts and members of the Asian American community was undertaken to acknowledge the mistreatment of the workers who built the railroad and tie into issues associated with the Say Their Names installation
- Black recommended that Parks Commissioners move ahead with the finalization of the project with the approval to locate the sculpture on APRC property and recommend that the City Council provide resources to the Say Their Names organizers to establish a permanent installation
- Landt stated if the landscaping around the base of the sculpture is low lying, there will be an increase in maintenance due to weed propagation. Landscaping in this area may be changed out to have vegetation that is 3-4' high to help reduce maintenance
 - Corio stated a desire to have landscaping that would not overtake the sculpture
 - Stallman added that the vision on the landscaped area would not drastically change from what is there currently
- Landt stated that there is a APRC lighting policy that should be reviewed when designing the lighting for the sculpture

Motion: Lewis recommended approval of this component of the HUB art in the park project. Seconded by Gardiner

Discussion: Lewis thanked the artists and stated the PAC, which Lewis sits on as an APRC representative, communicated that there was a desire to have the sculpture be railroad centric, but rather speak to how the railroad impacted Ashland. Lewis also stated he sat on the Historic Commission for 14 years and that there is the good, bad and the ugly about this town, but it has a history and the railroad is part of that history. Lewis stated that melding in the Chinese worker issues is moving ahead and doing a good job of trying to bring it up to date and that history is a way to tell a story.

Gardiner stated that this is an opportunity to bring art and history into the parks. Gardiner went on to say that had he made the motion he would have tied moving this project forward with the resolution on the Say Their Names installation. Gardiner may propose a second motion that includes recommendations to provide funding and resources to City Council.

Landt recommended including both installations in the same motion and would vote against the motion as stated because it does not incorporate an APRC position on the Say Their Names installation.

Eldridge stated that some concerns are not related to Say Their Names. Eldridge said honoring the Chinese workers seemed like an afterthought and the piece itself does not make a statement about social equity or the lessons learned from history. Eldridge stated a plan to abstain from the vote since the process has been going on for some time but cannot support at this time. Gardiner stated APRC Commissioner proposals is to only abstain from votes if there is a conflict of interest. Eldridge then stated an intention to vote no.

Landt raised a concern about the placement of the text to honor the Chinese workers, which is on the back of the sculpture. Gardiner added that most of the views will be coming from the bike path and will see the back of the sculpture and that there is not really a front or back of the sculpture.

Lewis stated openness to a friendly amendment. Landt provided a friendly amendment to change the motion to the following:

Recommend approval of the art and its location as outlined in the staff report, but we believe it is imperative that the Council dedicate similar resources, as this current installation received, for the Say Their Names Art installation and we recommend that. Lewis and Gardiner accepted the friendly amendment.

After discussion on the funding recommendation Landt altered the motion to add “at least” prior to similar resources. Lewis and Gardiner agreed to this alteration.

Original Motion: Lewis recommended approval of this component of the HUB art in the park project. Seconded by Gardiner

Amended Motion: Landt moved to recommend approval of the art and its location as outlined in the staff report, but we believe it is imperative that the Council dedicate at least similar resources as this current art installation received for the Say Their Names art installation and that is our recommendation. Amended Motion accepted by Lewis and Gardiner

Vote: Gardiner, Lewis and Landt voted yes. Eldridge voted no. – Motion passes

2. February 10, 2021 Calle Guanajuato Motion Correction

Motion: Landt moved to change the wording in the motion made on February 10, 2021 for the conditions of the Calle Guanajuato to say 2022 rather than 2021 under item #4. The condition should state: “Space allocation for the 2022 season will revert to 2019 unless the APR Commissioners change the policy.” Seconded by Lewis.

Vote: The vote was all yes

VIII. NEW BUSINESS

1. Q2 Budget Report (Action)

Black reviewed the [staff report included in the meeting packet](#). The following items were discussed:

- Staff prepares budget summary reports for the Commission to review each quarter and at the end of each fiscal year. The reports being presented at this time are monthly budget reports for February 2021. The City financial reports for December 31, 2020 are also included for review
- Target percentage for expenses at the end of February are on track to come under budget as a result of intentional cost cutting measures to increase the end fund balance, which will be used to support operations in the next budget cycle
- Recreation revenue is at 16% because of COVID-19 restrictions
 - Some recreation programs are earning revenue, such as golf course, and others are not earning revenue. The golf course may earn all of the revenue budgeted for Fiscal Year by June 30, 2021
- Staff is monitoring expenditures and revenue closely to ensure we are meeting monthly budget targets and COVID budget projections
- Food & Beverage (F&B) Tax are likely to come in higher than what was projected when COVID-19 restrictions were put into place
- Black stated it is expected the federal funds should be allocated to APRC to make up for F&B reductions in revenue
- Calle Revenue is at \$0 due to the decision to not charge users to rent the space as a way to support businesses struggling with COVID-19 restrictions
- Landt referenced a Q&A from the City of Ashland budget process that includes a statement that if F&B is not extended in 2030, assuming the City Staff proposal to fund APRC with F&B moves forward, then APRC will need to adjust operations and capital plans
 - Landt commented that if F&B were not extended APRC would lose 50% of its funding, which would be a drastic cut
 - Black stated that staff provided conditions from APRC prior to moving to this funding proposal which included the extension of F&B by ten years and added that if F&B is not extended he would go back to the City to determine how APRC would be funded

- Black stated the conditions have been sent to City Staff and there may be an opportunity to provide the conditions to the Budget Committee at a future meeting and also stated Commissioners are free to communicate the conditions on an individual basis to individual City Councilors
- Landt requested that the email sent to City staff that includes the conditions be forwarded to all Commissioners

Motion: Landt moved to acknowledge the staff report for the Q2 budget. Seconded by Lewis.

Vote: The vote was all yes

IX. ITEMS FROM COMMISSIONERS/STAFF

Gardiner stated a joint public electronic meeting with the Ashland School Board is being planned for April 27, 2021. Public comments will be taken during the meeting. The agenda is being drafted and will be posted once complete.

Public Arts Commission is meeting on Friday, April 16, 2021 to hear a presentation from the Say Their Names organizers.

Landt stated approval for limited herbicide use at Ashland Ponds was granted a few months back and noted the public notice stated the agenda item as an IPM waiver. Landt stated he would like to see a policy come to Commissioners pertaining to using clear language in communications and public notices, so the general public does not need to know jargon to understand meanings of communications and notices.

Eldridge stated the Forest Lands Commission (FLC) is embarking on a 8-12 month process of looking at projected climate change impacts on a local scale, mostly in the Ashland Watershed and hopes to put forward a set of recommendations for management and adaptation of watershed lands, including APRC lands. This process will likely be wrapped into the Ashland Forest Plan update.

X. UPCOMING MEETING DATES

1. Golf Course Subcommittee – April 22, 2021
 - Electronic Meeting —1:00 p.m.
2. Ashland Senior Advisory Committee – May 3, 2021
 - Electronic Meeting —3:30 p.m.
3. APRC Study Session — May 5, 2021(tentative)
 - Electronic Meeting—6:00 p.m.
4. APRC Regular Business Meeting — May 12, 2021
 - Electronic Meeting—6:00 p.m.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:03 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted
Sean Sullivan, Executive Assistant