

Council Communication

May 2, 2016, Study Session

8/10 Staffing Study for Ashland Fire & Rescue

FROM:

John Karns, Fire Chief, Ashland Fire & Rescue, karnsj@ashland.or.us

SUMMARY

At the Council Study Session of August 31, 2015, the Fire Chief presented information concerning the mission and future of Ashland Fire & Rescue. The basis of this presentation was the difficulty the department is facing maintaining quality service with its current staffing.

Council then requested that the Fire Chief develop and present a “menu” that further explained each of the options and strategies for addressing the staffing issue. This menu was presented on December 14th, 2015. As there are a number of different approaches to consider, it was felt that further clarification of each was appropriate before evaluating them. The options discussed, in varying degrees, help to deal with this issue either through enhanced staffing or reduced call volume. There are also several administrative opportunities that will help in the long term. Many of these strategies come with a cost and some carry significant ramifications that should be carefully assessed.

At the conclusion of the menu presentation Council asked the Fire Chief to bring back a more detailed assessment of transitioning to 8/10 staffing from 8/9 staffing. That is the basis of this presentation. This presentation looks at the 8/10 staffing in close detail. Council is being asked to evaluate the 8/10 staffing option to ensure adequate staffing so that Ashland Fire & Rescue can maintain quality service delivery.

BACKGROUND AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS:

Ashland Fire & Rescue has been increasingly challenged to provide the appropriate number of resources for our response requests for a number of years. With the same 27 member line-personnel force we are now responding to close to 4000 calls annually. The average call volume over the last ten years has been 3418. We are also seeing a sharp increase in the non-emergent medical transfers after the Ashland Community Hospital reorganization. The Fire Chief has requested additional personnel each of the last six years. Two years ago a change in the staffing window from 7/9 to 8/9 was approved which helped but no new personnel were hired. During this same time Medford Fire Department created five new positions and Jackson County Fire District 3 added six new positions to ensure an appropriate level of service for their communities. There are a number of factors that contribute to this increased call volume including local demographics, increasing public reliance on the 911 system, increasing out of area medical transports, and other influences.

The result of inadequate staffing causes periods during a shift when there are no personnel available to



respond or insufficient personnel available for an event. Often when medical requests are made during this time we ask Mercy Flights to respond and provide transportation through our mutual aid agreement. The response time for Mercy Flights into Ashland is much longer than AF&R. For fire or other emergency calls we rely on our neighboring departments to respond if available, again with much longer response times. For many medical events and obviously fire calls, response time can drive the outcome of the call. During a recent weekend the department was without of available personnel 11 times.

A move from an 8/9 to 8/10 staffing profile has the potential of placing one more Firefighter/Paramedic on duty on any given shift, though the minimum level stays at eight. The real advantage of increased staffing won't be realized until we see a 9/10 staffing profile. We can move to the 8/10 staffing model with a near no-cost the first year due to the savings in overtime. This is further explained in the body of the document.

COUNCIL GOALS SUPPORTED:

23. Support innovative programs that protect the community

FISCAL IMPLICATIONS:

The approximate cost for 8/10 staffing are as follows:

- First year \$7,904
- Second year \$27,015 to \$29,176
- Third year \$39,317 to \$42,462
- Fourth year \$52,059 to \$56,223

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUESTED ACTION:

N/A Information Only

SUGGESTED MOTION:

N/A Information only

ATTACHMENTS:

8/10 Staffing Presentation Document



INTRODUCTION

As has been presented to Council on several occasions, the current staffing level of Ashland Fire & Rescue is inadequate to sustain the appropriate level of service as well as desirable response times to incidents. The goal of the fire department is to ultimately achieve a 10/11 member per shift staffing level even if this takes a number of years to realize. This is the correct staffing level for Ashland Fire & Rescue. The department has requested increased staffing during every budget cycle in the last six years. In December of 2015 the Fire Chief presented a “Staffing Menu” to Council that discussed a number of options to address this issue with both short and long term strategies. A request was made by Council to further evaluate the impact and cost of adopting an 8/10 staffing model now with a three-year phase-in of 9/10 staffing.

The following tutorial was developed to fully explain the operational and fiscal implications of moving to an 8/10 staffing level from our current 8/9 staffing level. This is a graphical and explanatory look at the various staffing opportunities that existed on actual work days. It will demonstrate how staffing is affected by our constant staffing agreement, requests for leave (such as sick time, FMLA, vacation leave, training leave, etc.), and the resulting impact on overtime costs. It will also show how these costs are influenced by transitioning to an 8/10 staffing level. Finally, it will estimate the cost of a transition from 8/10 to 9/10 over a three year period when the full operational advantage will be realized.

This document will demonstrate:

1. How 8/9 Staffing works and the process for filling vacancies for a particular date.
2. How 8/10 Staffing would work on the same date.
3. The number of overtime hours the department could save if we were at 8/10 Staffing.
4. The cost of 8/10 Staffing (three new firefighters) compared to the cost of overtime expenses for existing personnel.
5. The cost of increasing our staffing, over a three year period, to a 9/10 model.
6. Present staffing variables, assumptions, and long range staffing goals.

STAFFING MODELS

The first concept to understand is how we staff the department on any given day. Ashland Fire & Rescue currently has 27 line staff members. These firefighter-paramedics are divided into three shifts of nine (A, B and C shifts). Each shift takes a turn staffing the departments vehicles on a 24/7 basis. Each shift works ten 24-hour shifts per month, producing a 56 hour work week. As with most places of employment, vacations, training, family medical leave act (FMLA), jury leave, and sick time are part of the daily staffing dilemma. Unlike most places of employment however, we cannot simply “close” an ambulance, a fire engine, or a fire station for the day.

To help keep track of who is and who is not working, the department utilizes a staffing computer program called Telestaff. This program looks at our future shifts and alerts staff if there is a staffing shortfall. It will also notify members of opportunities to fill vacancies and records members’ acceptance or refusal of those opportunities. The following eight pages give a visual representation of what our staffing looks like through the Telestaff program.

Telestaff shows members either assigned to a vehicle or shown as Off Roster. Off Roster is simply a term that Telestaff uses to show a member not assigned to a vehicle. How we staff our vehicles changes from day to day dependent upon how many members are on duty (see below). Telestaff holds that 9th firefighter in the “Off Roster” position until:

1. They are needed to fill a vacancy (8 members on duty)
2. They are paired with the Station 1 engine firefighter to staff the rescue at Station 2. (9 members on duty)

Either way, they are needed on a vehicle, but holding them in the “Off Roster” position allows Telestaff and the BC to make last minute changes as needed.

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	---

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

5	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	X
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
8	Engineer	Foss, Justin	X

Off Roster

9	Firefighter	Turner, Shannon	X
---	-------------	-----------------	---

Telestaff 2.9

The department is currently staffed at what we call 8/9 Staffing. This means that the department is staffed 24/7 with a minimum of 8 personnel and a maximum of 9. Above is a representation of what our staffing program, Telestaff, looks like. We call this the Roster. The Roster shows what personnel are on duty on any given shift.

If we were to have looked at the Roster for July 5, 2014 (above), back in January of 2014, it would appear as shown. As you can see, the 9th firefighter is shown "*Off Roster*". On days when we have all 9 personnel the firefighter from Engine 8801 will be teamed up with the *Off Roster* firefighter to staff another ambulance (Tim would come off Engine 8801 and staff a Rescue with Shannon). It is common to have two or three ambulances on calls simultaneously.

Now let's assume that in March of 2014, four months before he is assigned to work on July 5th, Robert Trask decides to take this day off as vacation.

Go to next page

Ashland Fire & Rescue

Saturday July 5, 2014

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	---

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

5	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	V
		?	
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
8	Engineer	Foss, Justin	X

Off Roster

9	Firefighter	Turner, Shannon	X
---	-------------	-----------------	---

Telestaff 2.9

Robert submits his vacation request and it is approved. We allow two personnel to have time off on any given shift. Robert's position on the roster now shows a red "V" (for Vacation) instead of an "X". Because Rescue 8831 must have 2 firefighters, his vacancy creates an opening that must be filled. Fortunately for us, Shannon is still floating out there in the "Off Roster" position. Instead of having to hire someone back on overtime, we can simply move Shannon from "Off Roster" up to the Rescue 8831 vacancy. However we now only have two members on the engine company.

Go to next page

Ashland Fire & Rescue

Saturday July 5, 2014

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	----------

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

5	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	V
		Turner, Shannon	X
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
8	Engineer	Foss, Justin	X

Telestaff 2.9

Shannon will now fill the vacancy created by Robert with no additional charge to our budget.

As you can see, having an additional firefighter in the form of 8/9 Staffing saved the city 24 hours of overtime expense. However, it should be noted, the department will no longer be able to staff a second ambulance from Station 1 due to the loss of the Off Roster firefighter (Shannon).

Now, let's assume that in April of 2014, Engineer Justin Foss would also like to have July 5th off on vacation (contract allows two individuals off at the same time).

Go to next page

Ashland Fire & Rescue

Saturday July 5, 2014

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	---

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

5	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	V
		Turner, Shannon	X
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
8	Engineer	Foss, Justin	V
		?	

Telestaff 2.9

Justin submits his vacation request and it is approved. Justin's position on the roster now shows a red "V" instead of an "X". Unfortunatley for us, there are no other "Off Roster" personnel to fill this vacancy. The Batallion Chief will now allow Telestaff to hire back an engineer to fill the vacancy at the departments overtime rate.

Go to next page

Ashland Fire & Rescue 8/10 Staffing – March 2016

Ashland Fire & Rescue

Saturday July 5, 2014

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	----------

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

5	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	V
		Turner, Shannon	X
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
8	Engineer	Foss, Justin	V
		Rod Lacoste	OT

Telestaff 2.9

Rod Lacoste agreed to work as engineer on July 5th and is now shown in green. Rod will be working on Engine 8802 on an overtime shift.

It is important to point out that personnel working on overtime, as in any department, are paid at 1 1/2 their normal rate. Basically, for each 24 hour shift of overtime an employee works, they are being paid for 36 hours.

Go to next page

You should now have a general understanding of 8/9 Staffing and how the Roster works. The next component of this tutorial is to conceptualize what would happen if we went to 8/10 Staffing. Utilizing the same date as before (July 5, 2014) let's look at how department staffing would occur if we had one additional firefighter on duty each day.

Ashland Fire & Rescue

Saturday July 5, 2014

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	---

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

5	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	X
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
8	Engineer	Foss, Justin	X

Off Roster

9	Firefighter	Turner, Shannon	X
10	Firefighter	Winwood, Brandon	X

Telestaff 2.9

Let's assume that we are now at 8/10 Staffing. The Roster now looks like this. As you can see, instead of a single "Off Roster" firefighter we now have two. This allows for two rescues and one engine to respond from Station 1.

As with the last scenario, both Robert Trask and Justin Foss want July 5th off.

Go to next page

Ashland Fire & Rescue

Saturday July 5, 2014

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	---

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

5	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	V
		?	
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
8	Engineer	Foss, Justin	V
		?	

Off Roster

9	Firefighter	Turner, Shannon	X
10	Firefighter	Winwood, Brandon	X

Telestaff 2.9

Both Robert Trask and Justin Foss submit Vacation time off requests for this date and both are approved. As before, the Vacations create vacancies on Rescue 8831 and Engine 8802. Fortunately for us, we have now have 2 firefighters that are in the "Off Roster" position.

Go to next page

Ashland Fire & Rescue

Saturday July 5, 2014

C Shift

Station 1

Command Vehicle 8853

1	Battalion Chief	Shepherd, David	X
---	-----------------	-----------------	---

Engine 8801

2	Captain	Hanstein, David	X
3	Engineer	Roselip, David	X
4	Firefighter	Hegdahl, Tim	X

Rescue 8831

	Firefighter	Trask, Robert	V
5	Firefighter	Winwood, Brandon	X
6	Firefighter	Stoy, Trent	X

Station 2

Engine 8802

7	Captain	Burns, Kelly	X
	Engineer	Foss, Justin	V
8	Engineer	Turner, Shannon	MU

Telestaff 2.9

We can now move Brandon up to cover for Robert and as Shannon is also a Move-Up Engineer, he can cover the vacancy created by Justin. If you will remember in the first scenario with 8/9 Staffing, it was necessary to hire an Engineer back on overtime. With 8/10 Staffing we are able to move the 10th firefighter into the vacancy, eliminating the overtime expense.

Go to next page

Now that you have an understanding of the difference between 8/9 Staffing and 8/10 Staffing we need to talk about the financial impacts of each. As you have probably already realized, having 10 firefighters on duty each day will produce substantial savings in overtime expenses. However, you may also realize that in order to have 10 firefighters on duty each day we would need to hire one additional firefighter per shift for each of the three shifts.

To determine if this might be financially practical, we need to calculate the total overtime expense associated with 8/9 Staffing and compare that to the total cost of three new firefighters in an 8/10 Staffing model. Remember that to achieve 8/10 staffing we need to add one firefighter to each shift.

Using the Telestaff program as outlined on the previous pages, we looked at two years of actual shifts. For each day that we determined a 10th firefighter would have been able to cover a vacancy instead of hiring a firefighter back on overtime for the full or partial shift, it was noted on the following spreadsheets. The following data gives a daily/monthly/yearly count of the “available” overtime hours to be saved by an 8/10 staffing model. The hours of the two years evaluated were averaged to achieve a base-line for subsequent comparison of costs.

Ashland Fire & Rescue 8/10 Staffing – March 2016

	2014						2014					
Day	January	February	March	April	May	June	July	August	September	October	November	December
1	24	0	0	0	0	4	24	24	14	24	24	4
2	24	0	24	24	24	2	18	24	24	24	24	0
3	24	0	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	0	0
4	24	0	0	0	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	4
5	24	0	0	24	0	5	24	24	24	7	24	4
6	0	0	0	0	0	0	24	24	24	8	24	24
7	0	0	0	0	8	24	15	24	24	12	24	24
8	0	24	0	24	24	24	16	24	24	3	13	0
9	0	24	24	24	24	0	24	24	24	5	24	24
10	24	24	24	24	10	0	24	24	17	24	0	24
11	24	5	10	16	18	24	24	24	0	24	15	0
12	24	0	11	10	9	24	24	24	24	22	24	24
13	0	4	0	0	0	4	6	24	24	24	24	24
14	0	24	11	0	9	6	24	24	24	24	24	24
15	0	24	0	22	13	24	24	24	0	0	24	0
16	24	0	0	19	0	18	24	24	0	0	0	0
17	24	0	5	9	12	5	0	24	24	24	0	0
18	0	0	0	24	0	0	24	24	24	24	24	12
19	0	24	0	24	0	6	24	5	4	24	24	24
20	24	24	0	24	24	6	24	24	24	24	0	24
21	6	0	24	24	24	24	24	24	10	24	0	24
22	0	24	24	0	24	24	24	0	0	18	9	0
23	0	24	0	0	24	24	24	0	5	4	0	24
24	0	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	7	10	0
25	0	24	9	24	24	6	24	24	17	20	0	24
26	24	13	24	24	24	6	24	24	24	11	0	0
27	15	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	0	24
28	0	24	24	24	12	24	24	24	24	24	0	24
29	8	0	24	0	12	24	9	0	20	24	24	24
30	0	0	0	0	14	24	24	24	24	0	0	24
31	0	0	24	0	0	0	16	24	0	24	0	24
Monthly Total	317	334	334	436	429	428	656	653	543	525	383	432
In 2014 Total Overtime Hours That Could Have Been Covered If At 10/8 Staffing =							5470					

This spread sheet shows that for CY 2014, an 8/10 staffing model would have save 5470 hours in overtime. Each year varies, the following page takes a look at 2015.

Ashland Fire & Rescue 8/10 Staffing – March 2016

	2015						2015					
Day	January	February	March	April	May	June	July	August	September	October	November	December
1	4	11	2	0	24	0	4	9	0	0	0	24
2	0	24	9	24	0	24	24	24	3	24	24	21
3	0	24	0	0	24	24	6	24	0	24	24	0
4	0	24	24	0	24	3	24	11	24	11	24	15
5	0	0	24	0	24	0	24	24	0	0	24	24
6	0	0	10	0	14	24	24	24	24	0	24	24
7	0	0	24	0	0	24	24	24	24	8	24	24
8	24	24	0	7	0	18	24	6	0	0	24	4
9	0	24	7	16	24	24	6	24	0	0	24	0
10	24	0	16	22	24	0	24	24	1	4	0	9
11	0	0	10	10	24	0	24	24	24	0	24	8
12	18	24	24	0	24	2	0	24	24	24	24	0
13	14	19	12	24	24	24	0	24	24	24	24	0
14	0	5	7	24	24	24	7	24	24	10	24	10
15	4	0	7	14	0	24	0	24	0	24	24	0
16	24	24	13	0	12	0	24	24	24	0	24	6
17	24	24	9	0	13	6	19	15	0	4	24	24
18	24	13	0	6	24	24	24	24	24	24	24	24
19	0	24	15	4	0	24	24	0	4	24	0	0
20	0	24	0	0	0	24	24	13	24	24	0	0
21	4	0	0	4	4	24	24	24	6	24	24	0
22	0	24	0	14	24	24	24	24	0	0	0	15
23	24	9	7	9	24	24	24	0	0	0	24	24
24	24	0	24	19	24	24	24	0	0	24	24	24
25	0	5	24	24	0	0	24	24	17	24	24	24
26	0	0	0	24	24	15	24	24	24	24	12	24
27	5	0	0	0	24	8	24	0	24	24	0	24
28	10	24	24	4	24	24	24	24	20	24	0	0
29	0	0	24	24	24	0	24	0	24	24	24	24
30	24	0	0	24	0	0	24	14	24	24	24	0
31	24	0	0	0	24	0	0	24	0	24	0	24
Monthly Total	275	350	316	297	499	436	570	548	387	445	540	400

In 2015 Total Overtime Hours That Could Have Been Covered If At 10/8 Staffing

5063

Average Hours Saved with 10/8 Staffing for CY 2014 and 2015

5266.5

Now we need to look at how much savings in overtime is available compared to the cost of hiring the three new firefighters necessary to achieve the 8/10 staffing level. For the cost of the overtime calculation, we'll use the rate of top-step engineer. This represents a good "middle of the road" cost for employees. There is one rank below engineer (firefighter – 12 members) and two above (captains and battalion chiefs - 9 members). As with all departments the cost per hour for overtime is calculated at time and one-half. While there are some benefit costs that "roll-up" at time and one-half, such as FICA, Medicare, HRA VEBA, there are other benefits that are fixed costs such as health insurance and deferred compensation that don't change with overtime pay. This is why the cost for overtime is quite close to the cost of a new hire when calculating salary and benefits which is typically 1.4 to 1.6 times the cost of salary, depending on rank and step of pay.

The cost of the firefighters is obviously lowest while they're at step one of their six-step pay range. This first step is for six months, second step for the next six months, and third step for the next year, and so on. During the first year of employment the department doesn't grant vacation leave so there is some reduction in overtime costs when there are firefighters on probation. We have used salary figures that are from the recently agreed upon contract with the bargaining unit.

The spread sheet on the next page compares the savings in overtime with the cost of three new firefighters for each of their six pay steps. As you can see there is a savings in overtime, based on the previously determined average of leave requested, of \$324,611 per year. It is necessary to understand that overtime use is very dynamic and is influenced by illness, injury, maternity leave, retirements, large fire events (regionally and state-wide), training, and many other factors. It is impossible to predict overtime activity with any degree of accuracy.

To indicate the true cost of the three new firefighters in the first year we need to average the cost of the first two pay steps as each one has a six month term. That yields a cost for three new firefighters for the first year of \$332,516. This produces a net cost of the 8/10 staffing level for the first year of \$7,904. The net cost for subsequent years will increase as the three firefighters earn their new pay steps, basically one step per year. The compensation increase due to contractual agreements will largely be offset by a corresponding increase in overtime savings.

Please look at the following spread sheet developed by the fire and finance departments that reflects, as accurately as possible, the costs involved in transitioning to 8/10 staffing from 8/9 staffing. This spread sheet looks at the averaged overtime savings and compares that with the cost of the three firefighters over all six pay step ranges. It takes a firefighter five years to achieve top step in pay.

Ashland Fire & Rescue 8/10 Staffing – March 2016

													Health Insurance				Workers Comp					
	2014/2015		Deferred			Gross	HRA VEBA	FICA	Medicare	Tier 1 FF	OPSRP FF	EE	Medical						Total			
Title	Wage	Hours	Comp	Holiday	FLSA	Pay	2%	6.20%	1.45%	20.89%	15.66%	6.00%	& Dental	AD & D	Life	LTD	WC	Wckmp	Benefits	Total		
Top Step Engineer - Overtime Hours	44.0814	5266.5	-	-	-	232,154.69	4,643.09	14,408.50	3,400.37	48,497.12		13,929.28	-	-	-	-	80.00	7,498.60	92,456.96	324,611.65	Overtime Cost =	324,611.65
(wage shown is OT wage, time and one half)												-										
												-										
												-										
Entry Level Firefighter - First Six Months	21.6886	2754	479.96	2,429.12	5,075.13	67,714.62	1,354.29	4,167.23	1,005.24		10,604.11	4,062.88	17,404.30	28.44	286.71	135.33	80.00	1,944.79	41,073.32	108,787.94	3 New Firefighters =	\$326,364
Second Step Firefighter - Second Six Months	22.6697	2754	479.96	2,539.01	5,304.71	70,756.03	1,415.12	4,355.80	1,049.34		11,080.39	4,245.36	17,404.30	29.72	299.68	141.46	80.00	2,032.07	42,133.23	112,889.26	3 Second Step Firefighters =	\$338,668
Third Step Firefighter - Next Year	23.703	2754	479.96	2,654.74	5,546.50	73,959.26	1,479.19	4,554.40	1,095.79		11,582.02	4,437.56	17,404.30	31.06	313.33	147.90	80.00	2,123.98	43,249.53	117,208.79	3 Third Step Firefighters =	\$351,626
Fourth Step Firefighter - Next Year	24.684	2754	479.96	2,764.61	5,776.06	77,000.36	1,540.01	4,742.95	1,139.88		12,058.26	4,620.02	17,404.30	32.34	326.30	154.03	80.00	2,211.25	44,309.33	121,309.69	3 Fourth Steop Firefighters =	\$363,929
Fifth Steo Firefighter - Next Year	25.7	2754	479.96	2,878.40	6,013.80	80,149.96	1,603.00	4,938.22	1,185.55		12,551.48	4,809.00	17,404.30	33.66	339.73	160.36	80.00	2,301.63	45,406.94	125,556.90	3 Fifth Step Firefighters =	\$376,671
Top Step Firefighter	26.6639	2754	479.96	2,986.36	6,239.35	83,138.05	1,662.76	5,123.49	1,228.88		13,019.42	4,988.28	17,404.30	34.92	352.48	166.38	80.00	2,387.37	46,448.27	129,586.32	3 Top Step Firefighters =	\$388,759

The savings in overtime will also go up with time somewhat as our members achieve higher pay steps.

Now we will look at the cost of narrowing the staffing window from 8/10 to 9/10 which is when the maximum advantage is realized from an operational perspective. Part of this proposal is to change the staffing window from 8/10 to 9/10 one shift per year, for three years. This would produce a 9/10 staffing profile for all three shifts. The cost for this would be approximately one-third of the overtime savings each year that the staffing window is changed. We can see above that the overtime savings is projected at \$324,611 thus narrowing the staffing window would be approximately \$108,000 each year we move to 9/10 staffing.

Ashland Fire & Rescue 8/10 Staffing – March 2016

To conclude this summary we must look at some of the variables in staffing, make some assumptions, and revisit what the goal is in terms of staffing and providing an appropriate level of service.

- Factors that affect overtime
 - Vacation time
 - FMLA
 - Illness and injury (on and off duty)
 - Training leave
 - Comp leave
 - Large fire and other emergency events (This past year we participating in a number of state-wide mutual aid fires that produced significant overtime costs. Fortunately the larger and longer-term events were eligible for state and FEMA reimbursement so we were compensated for most of the overtime costs. That funding is represented in our budget adjustments throughout the year)
 - Jury leave
- Overtime is highly dynamic with few discretionary components
- While there are many factors affecting our call volume, demographics is near or at the top of the list. This is an influence that is likely to increase if current trending continues.
- The cost of transitioning to 9/10 staffing from 8/10 will be approximately one-third of the overtime savings per year. The full benefit of 10 members per shift won't be realized until 9/10 staffing is in place on all three shifts.

We have provided to you a summary of this issue that is complete as possible with figures that are as accurate we can ascertain.

For a fire department to exhaust the on-duty staff during large or long-term events is to be expected and the reason most departments have mutual and automatic aid agreements in place. Ashland Fire & Rescue has mutual aid agreements in place with fire departments in Jackson and Josephine Counties through the Rogue Valley Fire Chiefs Association. However, to run out of staff on nearly a daily basis due to “bread and butter” responses is simply a function of inadequate staffing and a disservice to the community. We cannot continue to operate at our current staffing level and provide an appropriate level of service to our community.

The proper staffing level for Ashland's fire department as it is currently structured is a 10/11 staffing level ideally enhanced by a volunteer or student program. I clearly understand that increasing staffing is expensive and needs to be implemented over time. However I've presented this service gap for six years with no progress in a resolve. The issue and solution is clear. I encourage you to start the 8/10 staffing on July 1, 2016, and then initiate 9/10 staffing for one shift starting July 1, 2017. This should continue for three years until 9/10 staffing exists on all three shifts.

We will continue to pursue the FEMA SAFER grant opportunity that covers the cost (usually for two or three years) of enhanced staffing for inadequately staffed fire departments, though less than 2% of departments applying receive awards. Through hiring-back two members who retired at the first of the year, we've saved nearly half of the cost of the first year of 8/10 staffing.

Thank you for your consideration