

**COST REVIEW AD-HOC COMMITTEE DRAFT MINUTES  
WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 19, 2020 3PM – 5PM  
SISKIYOU ROOM  
51 WINBURN WAY**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

**Chair Slattery called the Cost Ad-Hoc Meeting to order at 3:00 PM.**

Committee members Jim Bachman, Shane Hunter, Pamela Lucas, Stefani Seffiner, Mike Morris and Shaun Moran were present. Committee members Roberta Stebbins, Julie Akins and Mark Welch were absent.

**II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

**1. Cost Ad-Hoc Review Committee February 12, 2020**

**Bachman/Lucas moved to approve the minutes. Discussion: None. All Ayes. Motion passed unanimously.**

**III. ESSENTIAL AND VALUE SERVICES DISCUSSION**

City Administrator Kelly Madding gave a brief Staff report. Administrative Service Manager Bryn Morrison handed out a spreadsheet regarding Essential Services (*see attached*).

The Committee discussed essential and value services.

Items discussed were:

- Planning and building inspection requirements.
- Planning and Public Works Director be combined.
- Municipal Court mandates.
- Ashland Fire and Rescue and building fees.
- Surcharges.
- Grants.
- Economic Development Program.
- Value services.
- Payroll outsourcing.

**IV. GENERAL FUND FUNCTIONS AND FUNDING**

The Committee came up with a list of items to bring to back to Council:

- Grants

- Ambulance
- Marijuana Revenue
- Payroll outsourcing
- Planning Director
- Emergency Preparedness/CERT
- AFR and ambulance
- Economic Development
- Parking Meters
- PERS/Healthcare
- Central Services
- Fire Call Responses
- Staffing Model from Paramedics to EMT

The Committee discussed RVTV and Social Service Grants.

The Committee discussed the Commission/Committee Staff time spreadsheet (*see attached*).

The Committee discussed outsourcing options.

Roberta Stebbins submitted a document into the record (*see attached*).

It was confirmed that the next Cost Ad-Hoc Committee Meeting will be on March 10<sup>th</sup> from 3-6 PM in the Siskiyou Room.

## V. ADJOURNMENT

**The Cost Ad-Hoc Committee Meeting was adjourned at 4:50 PM.**

**Respectfully submitted by:**

---

**City Recorder Melissa Huhtala**

**Attest:**

---

**Chair Slattery**

*In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Administrator's office at (541) 488-6002 (TTY phone number 1-800-735-2900). Notification 72 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to ensure accessibility to the meeting (28 CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title I).*

City of Ashland  
Essential Services vs Value Services  
General Fund

	Expenditures		Revenue		% of Expenditures	Source
	2019-20 Budget	2019-20 Budget	General Fund need	% of Expenditures		
<b>Essential:</b>						
Municipal Court	\$ 698,643	\$ 195,500	\$ 503,143		28%	Court Fees
Planning & Building Inspections/Plan Review	2,440,639	942,650	1,497,989		39%	Planning/Building Services and Permits
Fire	7,910,057	1,440,500	6,469,557		18%	Fire Division Services, Transports, Transfers, Memberships, EMS Fee, Fire Plan Check Review, Inspections
Police	8,237,420	623,000	7,614,420		8%	Police Fees, Marijuana Revenue
Parks Maintenance	5,391,900	5,391,900	-		100%	Property Tax
	<u>\$ 24,678,659</u>	<u>\$ 8,593,550</u>	<u>\$ 16,085,109</u>			
<b>Value:</b>						
Emergency Preparedness	\$ 129,683	\$ -	\$ 129,683		0%	CERT grants
Reduce Wildfire and Smoke Risk	1,312,634	1,118,483	194,151		85%	Grants, AFR Fee, Transfer from Water \$50,000
Economic Development - Not Restricted Grants	150,000	150,000	-		100%	Transient Occupancy Tax
Economic Development - Not Restricted Program	182,122	182,122	-		100%	Transient Occupancy Tax
Housing Needs	96,895	-	96,895		0%	Legal requirement to manage existing affordable housing stock, Portion of Program in CDBG Fund
Downtown Parking	168,000	705,727	(537,727)		420%	Parking revenue, TOT, includes previously collected \$370,000
	<u>\$ 2,039,334</u>	<u>\$ 2,156,332</u>	<u>\$ (116,998)</u>			
<b>Tourism - Restricted:</b>						
Long Term Parking	\$ 245,727	\$ 245,727	\$ -		100%	Transient Occupancy Tax
Tourism Grants	636,338	636,338	-		100%	Transient Occupancy Tax
Public Art	21,125	21,125	-		100%	Transient Occupancy Tax
Other City Tourism eligible Capital Projects	46,694	46,694	-		100%	Transient Occupancy Tax
	<u>\$ 949,884</u>	<u>\$ 949,884</u>	<u>\$ -</u>			
<b>Imposed by Charter:</b>						
Band	\$ 66,274	\$ -	\$ 66,274		0%	
Debt	473,156	473,156	-		100%	Bonds paid by Property Tax
Cemetery	532,967	106,500	426,467		20%	Graves, Niches & Crypts, Liners and Markers, Sexton Fees, Cemetery Trust
	<u>\$ 1,072,397</u>	<u>\$ 579,656</u>	<u>\$ 492,741</u>			
<b>Not Essential or Value Service based upon Resolution:</b>						
RVTV	\$ 64,584	\$ -	\$ 29,584		0%	Peg Fees of \$35,000 per year offsets capital costs only
Community Development - Social Service Grants	134,000	-	134,000		0%	
	<u>\$ 198,584</u>	<u>\$ -</u>	<u>\$ 163,584</u>			
<b>Value Services not fund specific:</b>						
Address Climate Change						
Homeless Services						
All-Age Friendly Community						

Committee/Commission Name	Job Classification	Hours of Support per Year	Total Cost
<b>Administration</b>			
Conservation & Climate Outreach Commission	Climate Analyst	72	\$ 3,225.60
	Asst City Administrator	48	4,224.00
	Administrative Analyst	72	2,766.82
		<u>192</u>	<u>\$ 10,216.42</u>
Climate Policy Commission	Climate Analyst	72	3,225.60
	Asst City Administrator	48	4,224.00
	Administrative Analyst	72	2,766.82
		<u>192</u>	<u>\$ 10,216.42</u>
		<u><b>384</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 20,432.83</b></u>
<b>Finance</b>			
Audit Commission	Finance Director	7	\$ 679.90
Audit Commission	Finance Administrative Assistant	18	678.89
Audit Commission	Deputy Finance Director	12	1,022.49
Audit Commission	City Administrator	2	258.90
Audit Commission	Parks Director	2	208.05
Audit Commission	Parks Recreation Superintendent	2	144.19
		<u>42</u>	<u>\$ 2,992.43</u>
Cost Review Ad Hoc	City Administrator	32	4,142.41
Cost Review Ad Hoc	Administrative Services Manager	80	5,493.59
		<u>112</u>	<u>\$ 9,636.00</u>
		<u><b>154</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 12,628.43</b></u>
<b>Police</b>			
Traffic	Traffic Officer	<u>24</u>	<u>\$ 1,769.16</u>
<b>Fire</b>			
Forest Lands Commission	Fire Division Chief	50	\$ 4,173.44
Forest Lands Commission	Fire Adapted Communities Coordinato	36	1,908.42
		<u>86</u>	<u>\$ 6,081.86</u>
Wildfire Safety Commission	Fire Adapted Communities Coordinato	410	21,734.79
Wildfire Safety Commission	Division Chief	125	10,433.60
		<u>535</u>	<u>\$ 32,168.39</u>
		<u><b>621</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 38,250.25</b></u>
<b>Public Works</b>			
Conservation Commission	Water Conservation Specialist	24	\$ 1,286.27
Airport Commission	Engineering Project Manager	120	6,431.33
Airport Commission	Senior Project Manager	126	7,090.53
Airport Commission	Deputy Public Works Director	8	701.14
Airport Commission	Public Works Director	4	426.50
		<u>258</u>	<u>\$ 14,649.50</u>
Transportation Commission	Public Works Director	6	639.75
Transportation Commission	Deputy Public Works Director	125	10,955.28
Transportation Commission	Administrative Assistant	60	2,305.68
		<u>424</u>	<u>\$ 13,900.71</u>
		<u><b>706</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 29,836.49</b></u>
<b>Community Development</b>			
Historic	Director	12	\$ 1,279.51
Historic	Planning Manager	192	15,262.89
Historic	Senior Planner	12	747.44
Historic	Planning Technician	216	8,982.18
Historic	Development Services Coordinator	3	169.49
		<u>435</u>	<u>\$ 26,441.51</u>
Housing & Human Services	Director	12	1,279.51
Housing & Human Services	Senior Planner	36	2,354.40
Housing & Human Services	Housing Specialist	192	10,290.12
Housing & Human Services	Planning Technician	108	3,879.53
Housing & Human Services	Development Services Coordinator	3	169.49
		<u>351</u>	<u>\$ 17,973.06</u>
Public Arts	Director	12	1,279.51
Public Arts	Planning Manager	6	476.97
Public Arts	Assistant Planner	192	7,836.58
Public Arts	Executive Assistant	60	2,669.12
Public Arts	Development Services Coordinator	3	169.49
		<u>273</u>	<u>\$ 12,431.66</u>
Tree	Director	12	1,279.51
Tree	Planning Manager	12	953.93
Tree	Senior Planner	12	747.44
Tree	Assistant Planner	192	7,836.58
Tree	Executive Assistant	48	2,135.29
Tree	Planning Technician	12	499.01
Tree	Planning Technician	12	431.06
Tree	Development Services Coordinator	3	169.49
		<u>771</u>	<u>\$ 14,052.31</u>
		<u><b>1,830</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 70,898.54</b></u>
<b>Parks</b>			
No data provided.			
		<u><b>3,718</b></u>	<u><b>\$ 173,815.70</b></u>

**MESSAGE TO THE COST REVIEW AD HOC COMMITTEE**  
**February 19, 2020**

**The City of Ashland sells a plethora of services, the primary component of which is labor. The purchasers are the tax payers.**

**This is our charge: *“The focus of this Cost Review Ad Hoc Committee is to investigate programs and operational expenditures including compensation and benefits with the goal of improving long-term financial sustainability.”***

**There have been many comments from committee members regarding costs:**

- What are various project budgets and how are the costs running?**
- Are these projects being covered by grants or general funds?**
- How much staff time is being spent at each commission/committee meeting?**
- Could we save by outsourcing some services?**
- Can we afford to continue some?**

**The list goes on and on and it appears that there is not a payroll system currently in place to provide answers in the detail necessary.**

**I feel that trying to collect these numbers in retrospect is counter productive both in time and assumptions needed.**

**I propose that the city investigate outsourcing its payroll services. In today's world this is a healthy industry, one ranging from small “mom and pop” to multinational. Programs are already running that print the paychecks, prepare the myriad of government reports, and produce management reports that address these questions (and many more).**

**Yes, this would take in-house adjustments. . . . Department heads would set time/cost budgets, employees would fill out time-sheets daily coding their time by minutes (1.1 hr = 1 hour/6 min.) to projects/admin/meetings/holiday/vacation/travel, etc.. . . . It is not as onerous as it may appear. It becomes a change of habit.**

**I feel this recommendation is primary to providing the data necessary to making responsible fiscal decisions that will impact the long-term financial stability of the city.**

**Respectfully submitted,**

***Roberta***

**Roberta W. Stebbins**