

Memo

TO: Ad-hoc City Hall Advisory Committee
 FROM: Kaylea Kathol, Engineering
 DATE: August 10, 2017
 RE: **Final list of tenable options for the replacement of City Hall**

When the Committee first met on April 26, 2017, staff presented a list of 13 alternatives for the replacement of City Hall. In the time that has passed, some alternatives have been eliminated over uncertainty relating to property acquisition, including alternatives proposed for the railroad property and the Elks parking lot. Other alternatives, specifically an in-kind rebuild of City Hall and seismic rehabilitation of the existing building, have been removed from the list due to their inability to accommodate the City’s current and projected space needs. The following list enumerates the alternatives that remain consistent with the Committee’s charge to identify the best option for replacing City Hall that meets the work space needs through 2031 and provides reasonable degree of seismic safety for employees.

Alternative*	Cost Estimate	Timeline (months)
1. ComDev: Expand & Consolidate	\$ 9.5 M	11
2. Right-Size City Hall + Keep ComDev	\$ 8.5 M	16
3. Right-Size/Keep Stucco City Hall + Keep ComDev	\$ 9.7 M	16
4. New @ Pioneer Parking & 50 UG Stall	\$ 16.1 M	17
5. New @ Pioneer Parking & 100 UG Stall	\$ 19.6 M	19
6. New @ Civic Center + Consolidate**	\$ 12.9 M	17
7. New @ Civic Center + Keep Com Dev**	\$ 11 M	16
8. Briscoe School + Consolidate**	\$ 8.1 M	16

*Alternative descriptions provided on following pages

**Alternatives developed by City after ORW completed Feasibility Study. Costs and timelines were estimated by staff, based on construction assumptions used in the Feasibility Study.



City Hall On-Site Expansion (2 Alternatives)

Rebuild City Hall on site, including a basement and three floors, in order to meet the City’s space needs. Reconfigure Community Development building to ensure room for growth. One alternative offers a total rebuild, and the other alternative proposes to retain the historic stucco veneer on the north and east surfaces of the building

- Proposed total area of completed project: **14,800 ft²**
- Cost (2 alternatives):**

Total rebuild/expand:	\$8.5 M	(\$574/sf)
Rebuild/expand, preserve facade:	\$9.7 M	(\$655/sf)

Community Development Expansion/Consolidation

Add an additional two floors to the Community Development building in order to consolidate functions currently housed in City Hall and Community Development.

- Proposed total area of completed project: **22,070 ft²** (inc. new area and renovated area)
- Cost:** **\$9.5 M** (\$430/sf)

Consolidate at New Construction at Lithia/Pioneer (2 Alternatives)

Consolidate functions housed in City Hall and Community Development in a new building on the existing City-owned parking lot at Lithia Way and N. Pioneer Street. Profit from the sale of the Community Development Building would be applied toward construction. One alternative offers one level of underground parking and the other offers two levels.

- Proposed total area of completed project: **26,135 square feet**
- Cost (2 alternatives):**

1 level of UG parking (50 stalls):	\$16 M	(\$612/sf)
2 levels of UG parking (100 stalls):	\$19.6 M	(\$750/sf)

Courts/Civic Center (2 alternatives)

Build a new City Hall at the location currently occupied by Courts/Civic Center. The new structure would necessarily incorporate the courts and council chambers. The first alternative, termed “centralized”, would incorporate the functions at the courts building, City Hall, and ComDev. The second alternative, described as “partitioned”, would result in the City retaining ComDev and building a smaller structure at the current courts location.

- Proposed total area of completed project: **17,520 ft² (partitioned) to 27,470 ft² (centralized)**
- Cost (2 alternatives):**

Partitioned:	\$10 M*	(\$570/sf)
Centralized:	\$13 M*	(\$473/sf)

* These estimates were developed by Staff using the cost modeling assumptions provided in the architect’s feasibility study. Professional estimate is advised.

Briscoe School

Move City Hall and Community Development functions to Briscoe School.

- Proposed total area of completed project: 33,980 ft² (existing structure)
- Cost:** **\$8.1 M** (\$238/sf)

* In 2005, Ashland School District commissioned a facilities report and seismic evaluation of Briscoe School to develop a cost estimate for necessary upgrades and repairs. Briscoe has been closed since 2004, so the facilities report naturally evaluated conditions through the lens of school operations. The study evaluated architectural, mechanical and plumbing systems, electrical systems, and structural (seismic) conditions. Total costs to implement all improvements was \$6.5 million. It should be noted that costs included the addition of some parking (approximately 18 or 19 spaces). The City has updated the construction costs to 2016 values based on the actual national average Historical Cost Index¹. Most items originally evaluated by the District were included in the City’s updated estimate, with the exception of a line item for expanding the kitchen and replacing its equipment. The total 2016 estimate was approximately \$8 million (including \$2.5 million in seismic retrofits). The 2016 estimate was then escalated by 5.5 percent per year for five years to provide a cost estimate of \$10.6 million in 2021. If the City sells the Community Development building for \$2.5 million², proceeds could be applied toward the project for a **total cost of \$8.1 million**. Professional estimate is advised.

¹ <http://info.thegordiangroup.com/RSMMeans.html>. City used actual 2005 cost index (151.6) and actual 2016 cost index (207.3).

² Real Market Value in 2016, Jackson County Property Data Online

