

Council Business Meeting

May 18, 2021

Agenda Item	Approval of a Professional Services Contract for Architectural and Engineering Services for Pioneer Hall and Community Center Facility Improvements	
From	Scott Fleury PE Kaylea Kathol PMP	Public Works Director Senior Project Manager
Contact	scott.fleury@ashland.or.us kaylea.kathol@ashland.or.us	(541) 552-2412 (541) 552-2419

SUMMARY

Before the Council is a scope of work and fee proposal for professional architectural and engineering services for the Pioneer Hall and Community Center Rehabilitation Projects with Marquess and Associates, Inc. (Marquess). Professional services for this project were solicited through an open request for Qualifications Based Selection (QBS). Marquess was selected as the most qualified among five proposers. The professional services component of this project has three phases: preliminary design and engineering; final engineering; and construction administration. Staff negotiated the scope of work for phase one, preliminary design and engineering, and concurs with the costs for this service.

At its April 20, 2021 Business Meeting, Council did not approve the contract to Marquess and instead directed staff to determine how long the successful proposer (Marquess) would be willing to maintain the validity of the proposal. This was verified by Marquess to be June 30, 2021,

Additionally, individual Councilors were invited to submit alternative ideas to the City Manager to consider moving forward. Staff is seeking direction on desired next steps with the acknowledgement that an open RFP solicitation is still in progress, which will need to be formally considered and a decision rendered on how to complete that process.

POLICIES, PLANS & GOALS SUPPORTED

Department Goals:

- Maintain existing infrastructure to meet regulatory requirements and minimize life-cycle costs
- Deliver timely life cycle capital improvement projects
- Maintain and improve infrastructure that enhances the economic vitality of the community
- Evaluate all city infrastructure regarding planning management and financial resources

PREVIOUS COUNCIL ACTION

[June 16, 2020](#) – Staff updated Council on structural, mechanical, electrical, and plumbing (MEP) deficiencies at Pioneer Hall and structural deficiencies at Community Center. Council directed staff to develop a plan to address deficiencies for both buildings.

[October 6, 2020](#) – Staff recommended addressing deficiencies at Pioneer Hall and Community Center via release of a formal public solicitation for professional engineering and architectural services via a Qualifications Based Selection (QBS) Request for Proposal (RFP). Council approved staff's recommendation.

[April 20, 2021](#) – Staff provided Council with a professional services contract with associated scope and fee for the rehabilitation project, as the next action based on previous Council direction.

BACKGROUND AND ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

At the April 20, 2021 Business Meeting Council discussed the professional services contract for engineering and architectural services for the Community Center and Pioneer Hall. The request before Council at that point was to approve the preliminary design contract with Marquess and Associates. The preliminary engineering scope was designed to only bring the building back to functional standards as a public accessed facility. The scope of services did not contemplate major changes to the structure or existing uses.

1. Preliminary Engineering

- a. Americans with Disabilities assessment
- b. Structural evaluation
- c. Heating, Air-conditioning and Ventilation
- d. Historic Building Review (State Historic Preservation Office)
- e. Preliminary Engineering Design Plans and Specifications

Subsequent to the April 20, 2021 meeting, individual suggestions for alternative actions included the formation of a community group to voluntarily review the materials, conduct a site visit and present their own findings and suggestions to Council for advised next steps.

Also suggested was direction to focus exclusively on the Community Center and defer action on Pioneer Hall until additional discussion with Ashland Parks and Recreation Commission as to the intended and desired user base for Pioneer Hall, which would inform future Council decision on the appropriate investment and schedule for addressing that facility.

Separating Pioneer Hall from the Community Center could likely be accomplished within the scope of the existing contract with Marquess. Staff could resolve any contract issues and return with a contract document that provides explicit prioritization for Community Center

The utilization of a community group is also possible and Council would need to determine the structure and membership of this group, its charge, timeline and desired deliverable back to Council.

Previous Background:

Staff advertised a QBS Request for Proposal (RFP) on October 8, 2020 on the ORPIN website statewide, in the Mail Tribune, and on the City's website. The RFP was developed to provide the City with flexibility through a phased approach. Phase one, preliminary engineering and cost estimating, is the first of three phases the RFP identified in the engineering scope of work. Later phases include final engineering (Phase two) and construction administration (Phase three). The first two design phases will develop appropriate architectural and engineering designs to improve the structural deficiencies of each building, repair or improve the mechanical, electrical and plumbing (MEP) systems for each building and ensure compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). At each phase there will be a formal scope and fee developed for each building, which will allow the City to either proceed with design phases and associated tasks for either or both facilities at the same time depending on priorities developed by Council. In addition, the RFP requires presentations to Council at the completion of both the preliminary and final design phases to ensure staff is meeting the expectations of Council and the Community with respect to the final construction project.

Five proposers responded to the RFP on November 10, 2020. Proposals were reviewed and scored by a team of four evaluators, including Scott Fleury, PE and Kaylea Kathol, PMP from City of Ashland Engineering; Michael Black, director of Ashland Parks and Recreation Commission; and Dale Shostrom, an external member of the public and Historic Commissioner, representing community interests. The evaluation team graded each proposal according to the criteria specified in the RFP. The top two of the proposers, Marquess

and ORW Architecture, were invited to second-round interviews/ presentations with the evaluation team during the first two weeks of January 2021. All four evaluators graded Marquess’s second-round interview highest. The results of proposal and interview scoring are summarized in the tables below:

Table 1. Summary of evaluation team’s scores of project proposals

CONSULTANT	TOTAL SCORE (Out of 400)	RANK
ORW Architecture	366	1
Marquess & Associates, Inc.	352	2
ZCS Engineering & Architecture	338	3
Arkitek Design & Architecture	311	4
Oregon Architecture	290	5

Table 2. Summary of evaluation team’s scores of interviews

CONSULTANT	TOTAL SCORE (Out of 160)	RANK
Marquess & Associates, Inc.	149	1
ORW Architecture	131.5	2

Staff sent a letter of intent to negotiate with Marquess on January 25, 2021. Marquess toured both buildings on February 11, 2021 with staff and public representatives to inform their scope of work and cost proposal. They submitted an initial proposal on March 16, 2021, and final proposal with City-requested revisions on April 1, 2021. Staff provided a notification of intent to award phase one on April 1, 2021, conditioned on Council approval of the contract.

To an extent, preliminary engineering has been partially complete for both buildings. Pioneer Hall has had a structural evaluation and an architectural code evaluation. Good progress has been made on schematic design for Pioneer Hall, but the plans are still incomplete. The Community Center has only had a structural evaluation. This valuable existing information will be utilized by Marquess to develop preliminary and final design documents along with updating cost estimates.

FISCAL IMPACTS

Phase one preliminary engineering and cost estimating services are expected to cost \$11,048 for Pioneer Hall and \$35,720 for the Community Center. Funds are currently appropriated in the Capital Improvement (Facilities) fund to support this phase of the project. In addition, staff has requested additional funds in the 2021-2023 Biennial Budget to support final engineering and construction. Although staff only anticipates awarding phase one at this time, a tentative, non-binding scope and fee estimate for phases two and three are included in the proposal and summarized in Table 3:

Table 3. Scope and fee for all project phases. Phases two and three will be negotiated and awarded separately and independently as authorized by Council.

ASHLAND COMMUNITY CENTER				
Discipline	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Totals
	Preliminary Design & Engineering	Final Design & Engineering	Construction Management	
Architectural	\$23,080	\$35,100	\$24,590	\$82,770
Structural	\$5,120	\$17,895	\$5,335	\$28,350
Mech/Electrical	\$2,520	\$13,440	\$2,690	\$18,650
Cost Estimating	\$5,000	\$0	\$0	\$5,000
Totals	\$35,720	\$66,435	\$32,615	\$134,770

PIONEER HALL				
Discipline	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Totals
	Preliminary Design & Engineering	Final Design & Engineering	Construction Management	
Architectural	\$8,598	\$9,648	\$6,784	\$25,030
Structural	\$550	\$9,650	\$3,320	\$13,520
Mech/Electrical	\$900	\$7,650	\$2,300	\$10,850
Cost Estimating	\$1,000	\$0	\$0	\$1,000
Totals	\$11,048	\$26,948	\$12,404	\$50,400

Direct construction cost estimates will be developed during preliminary engineering. When those costs are identified, staff will also include potential funding mechanisms, likely timelines for expenditures and potential impacts on other projects within the City’s facilities budget.

Grant Opportunities:

Staff will continue to research potential grant and low interest loan opportunities to assist with funding the complete improvement for both buildings.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Council authorized the City Administrator to enter into two professional services agreements with Marquess to provide preliminary engineering services for the rehabilitation of Pioneer Hall and the Community Center. Agreement amounts shall not the exceed \$11,048 (Pioneer Hall rehabilitation) and \$35,720 (Community Center rehabilitation). The incorporation of external participation in the RFP review and is a key addition to the process that staff feels provides significant value and sets the table for future expanded involvement with the community as the process moves forward.

ACTIONS, OPTIONS & POTENTIAL MOTIONS

- 1) I move approval of two professional services contract with Marquess and Associates for preliminary engineering in the amounts of \$11,048 and \$35,720
- 2) I move to amend the scope and fee of the professional services contract with Marquess and Associates for preliminary engineering (insert amendment).

- 3) I move to develop a community group through the creation of an Ad-Hoc committee to review existing reports and other work to date, evaluate the buildings and provide feedback and recommendations to Council for desired next action steps.

REFERENCES & ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Final negotiated scope, fee and schedule proposal from Marquess & Associates, Inc.



YOUR PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING TEAM SINCE 1957

P 541-772-7115 F 541-779-4079 1120 EAST JACKSON PO BOX 490 MEDFORD, OR 97501
EMAIL: info@marquess.com WEB: www.marquess.com

April 1, 2021

Scott Fleury, P.E.
Interim Public Works Director
City of Ashland
51 Winburn Way
Ashland, Oregon 97520

RE: REVISED PROPOSAL FOR ARCHITECTURAL AND ENGINEERING SERVICES IMPROVEMENTS TO ASHLAND COMMUNITY CENTER AND PIONEER HALL ASHLAND, OREGON MAI PROPOSAL NO. P20-9211

Dear Scott:

Thank you and the evaluation committee for requesting that Marquess & Associates, Inc. (MAI) submit a proposal for architectural and engineering services in support of the proposed improvements and expansion to these two City facilities. As part of our preparation of this REVISED proposal, we have had numerous discussions with City staff in person and via email about the project, and hope we have captured *and clarified* the scope and intent to which our services and fees will apply.

DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

The Community Center and Pioneer Hall are both civic buildings owned by the City of Ashland and utilized for community events. Both buildings require structural improvements and functional improvements to mechanical, electrical and plumbing systems. In addition, each facility requires upgrades to comply with ADA and building code requirements.

Pioneer Hall

Pioneer Hall is an assembly hall with a very simple floor plan consisting of a conference room, a meeting hall, a small kitchen, and existing accessible restrooms. During a previous project, drawings were completed to a design development (DD) level.

Ashland Community Center

The Ashland Community Center has a more complex layout that includes the main hall with raised stage, a large conference room, offices, a kitchen, some storage space, and restrooms that do not appear to meet current accessibility requirements. From the 1985 Joyce C. Ward plans, it is also evident that there are a few level changes at the west side

of the floor plan. The front porch has a set of stairs leading to the main doors as well as a short ramp.

It is understood that each building will be issued as a separate bid package, and the project fees will be tracked separately. However, it has been assumed for the purposes of this proposal that construction of the two projects will run concurrently. Project meetings, site visits, and community outreach will be scheduled to coincide with each other, and the project teams will remain consistent across both. Scope and fees for each building are reflected separately in the following proposal.

The projects are understood to be bid separately, and as such, Construction Administration fees assume that there will be separate contractors.

It is further understood that the architectural and engineering work, including scope, fees, and deliverables, are to be awarded and delivered separately and independently, and that award of Phase I does not specifically guarantee award of Phases 2 or 3 to the same engineer/architectural, firm or team and if the City so chooses, the City may select a different consultant for subsequent phases through a separate formal selection process.

SCOPE OF WORK

Provide general building design, historic resource review, structural, mechanical, and electrical engineering for Pioneer Hall and Ashland Community Center.

A. Architectural Services: (By Architectural Resources Group)

Refer to the attached fee spreadsheet for a breakdown by phase.

Pioneer Hall

1. **Preliminary Design and Engineering** to include review of existing documentation, and confirmation of existing conditions.
2. **Final Engineering** to include development of permit ready construction drawings (CD). The DD drawings previously developed for Pioneer Hall will be utilized moving forward. It is assumed that add-alternates will not be required for this building given the architectural scope is fairly simple. Architectural design scope will address the following:
 - A. Updated code and accessibility review, noting any change from previous project.
 - B. Providing improved accessibility
 - i. Adding vertical grab bars to existing accessible restrooms
 - ii. Replacing base cabinets at kitchen to meet accessibility requirements.
 - iii. Assumption: No changes are required to the existing accessible route into the building.
 - C. Replacing furred-out walls, ceiling, and floor finishes at Meeting Hall
 - D. Quantifying potential repairs/patching due to new structural and MEP work
 - E. Selecting plumbing and lighting fixtures appropriate for the historic building
 - F. Providing improved attic access

- G. Providing minimal roof details limited to area around replaced chimney (new cricket)
 - H. Providing new insulation at the attic
 - I. Facilitating up to (2) stakeholder meetings with the COA and the community. These will be held in conjunction with the Community Center.
3. Construction Services to include reviewing submittals, responding to RFIs, and attending one site visit at the completion of construction to identify contractor punch items. ARG will not attend weekly or bi-weekly construction meetings with the contractor but will collaborate with MAI, who will attend meetings as required.

Ashland Community Center

- 1. Preliminary Design and Engineering to include review of existing documentation, confirmation of existing conditions and development of schematic documents (SD).
- 2. Final Engineering to include development of design development (DD) and permit ready construction drawings (CD). Based on a preliminary review of the 1985 drawings provided by City of Ashland, there are expected to be substantial challenges if the goal is to create a fully accessible community center. Alternates will be utilized to provide the greatest flexibility during bid. Architectural design scope will address the following:
 - A. Providing an in-depth code and accessibility review to note any existing deficiency
 - B. Providing as-built drawings based on site visit
 - C. Providing improved accessibility
 - i. At a minimum, ensuring there is at least one fully accessible entry and egress point at the main entry doors. If the current ramp does not meet code, this may involve a re-design of the entry/ramp sequence. (The ramp may need to be longer). Civil or structural services (by Marquess) may be required if there are impacts to the sidewalk
 - ii. Providing accessible men's and women's rooms. This may require a change to the floor plan layout to increase the restroom sizes from what is existing (for instance, one of the offices may need to be removed).
 - iii. Providing potential options for creating an accessible stage and back stage area.
 - iv. Replacing kitchen base cabinets to be accessible if they are not already
 - v. Providing recommendations on doors/hardware that may not be currently accessible
 - D. Reviewing and providing potential options for other floor plan deficiencies (for examples, removing a wall at the backstage area to increase functionality as noted by the COA)
 - E. Quantifying potential repairs/patching due to new structural and MEP work
 - F. Selecting any new plumbing and lighting fixtures appropriate for the historic building

- G. Potentially providing new exterior wall and roof details dependent on the structural stabilization approach
 - H. Potentially selecting new floor finishes if replacement is required due to structural stabilization approach or accessibility approach
 - I. Providing new insulation at the attic
 - J. Facilitating up to (3) stakeholder meetings with the COA and the community. These will be held in conjunction with the Pioneer Hall.
3. Construction Services to include reviewing submittals, responding to RFIs, and attending up to two site visits during construction and one site visit at the completion of construction to identify contractor punch items. ARG will not attend weekly or bi-weekly meetings with the contractor, but will collaborate with MAI, who will attend meetings as required.

B. Historic Resource Review: (By Architectural Resources Group)

- 1. ARG will lead the local and state historic review processes for buildings. Because these are publicly owned buildings that have been found to be historically significant, proposed changes to both the Community Center and Pioneer Hall will be subject to review by the SHPO pursuant to Oregon Revised Statute 358.653. ARG will prepare and submit the necessary SHPO documentation for each building. In addition, ARG will complete the necessary consultation with the Ashland Historic Commission regarding the project.

C. Structural Engineering:

- 1. We will provide structural remediation design services for the two buildings, the scope of which will be as per our findings and recommendations in the MAI reports of October 2017 (Pioneer Hall) and April 2019 (Community Center). This will include design and remediation to the current applicable building codes including seismic, wind, and roof snow analysis.
- 2. We will provide documents required (plans and associated structural detail sheets) for inclusion in the building permit and construction sets.
- 3. Phasing of the structural engineering work will follow that of Architectural in scope and content.

D. Heating, Ventilating, and Air Conditioning:

- 1. For the Community Center, the existing ducted forced-air systems will be retained for comfort heating and cooling but will be cleaned, upgraded, and revised as necessary to follow any reconfiguring or re-purposing of the interior spaces and structure. Ventilation air for occupants, and exhaust air as required by the Mechanical Code, will be provided.
- 2. For Pioneer Hall, new split DX ducted heat pump systems will be designed to serve the occupied interior spaces, with Mechanical Code-compliant ventilation and exhaust air included.
- 3. For both buildings, energy code compliant programmable thermostats and ventilation air controls will be provided.

4. Energy-related forms and calculations for the applicable sections of the code will be prepared along with the mechanical drawings and specifications.
5. *Phase 1 services will include evaluation of current applicable codes; evaluation of the condition of the existing equipment for continued service; heat gain/heat loss calculations for the conditioned spaces to determine those requirements; evaluation of the existing equipment to suit the calculated loads and ventilation requirements; and preparation of a summary of those findings and recommended options to consider moving into design. All other listed scope will fall into Phase 2 final engineering.*

E. Plumbing:

1. For the Community Center, the existing sanitary drainage, waste, and vent piping will be retained but will be cleaned, upgraded, and revised as necessary to follow any reconfiguring or re-purposing of the interior spaces, structure, and roof. Hot and cold water piping and systems will also be retained but will be similarly treated. The selection and specification of plumbing fixtures will follow Architectural as to style, function, and required faucets and fittings.
2. For Pioneer Hall, plumbing will follow the same general approach as for the Community Center.

F. Fire Protection:

1. No fire sprinkling of either building is contemplated and no sprinkler system design is included.
2. No fire alarm systems are required for either building since they are A occupancies with fewer than 300 occupants, so no fire alarm design is included.
3. Size and location of portable fire extinguishers in compliance with current building and fire codes will be provided.

G. Electrical Engineering Services:

1. For the Community Center, the existing electrical service will be retained but will be cleaned, upgraded, and revised as necessary to follow any reconfiguring or re-purposing of the interior spaces, structure, and systems. Indoor electrical panels and systems will also be retained unless they are found to be unsafe or unserviceable. The selection and specification of lighting fixtures will follow Architectural as to style, function, and required accessories and finishes.
2. For Pioneer Hall, electrical will follow the same general approach as for the Community Center.

H. Standards for General Design, and Engineering:

1. Architectural, engineering, and CAD services are to be provided by our office, resulting in plans and specifications to be incorporated into the bid and contract documents. Deliverables to include two progress drawing check sets at the 50%

and 95% completion level and final construction plans stamped by Oregon registered professionals. Drawings will be prepared in AutoCAD.

2. Fees include furnishing of specifications for all work.

I. Other Scope Included:

1. Correlating to each of the three work phases, we will provide construction-phase services for clarifications of the plans; response and revisions in conjunction with Code agency review; review of the contractor's shop drawings and submittals; review and response to the contractor's requests for information (RFI); and review of requests for approval to substitute products or materials.
2. *Attendance of at least one representative at a City council meeting at the end of each design phase to assist staff in responding to technical questions.*

J. Work Not Included (available as additional services):

1. Value engineering after 100% completion of the construction documents.
2. Review of changes for the contractor's convenience.
3. Correction of deficiencies in the construction.
4. Design of alternate energy systems such as wind, solar, or hydro power.
5. Preparation of, or application for, energy rebate programs such as Energy Trust of Oregon.
6. Sustainable design beyond Oregon codes and standards, such as LEED certifications.

FEES

See the attached fee matrix and breakdown for the work requested and described, as well as our hourly chargeout rate schedules.

TERMS AND CONDITIONS

The above fees include reimbursable expenses for printing (other than bound sets for issuance to bidders or to plan review agencies); licenses, permits, and fees necessary for our design work; vehicle mileage, telephone calls, photographs, and consumable supplies. All additional work which is outside the scope of services as described shall be paid for at the hourly rate schedules attached.

As compensation for services rendered, a billing will be sent each month showing the hours and rates of the various classifications of personnel working on the project. Payments are due by the 20th of the following month. Late payments will be subject to a service charge of 1.5% per month on the unpaid balance. In the event that work is stopped on this project, the hourly rate shall determine the architectural and engineering fees.

The above fees are for a single design developed from a set of base drawings approved for design by the City's Representative. If the City's Representative, a Contractor, or the governing municipality or agency makes a change, which for its proper execution involves additional services

and/or expenses, changes to the drawings/specifications or causes changes in methods or procedures of handling the work; or, in the event the City's Representative or a Contractor delays the work causing additional hours or becomes delinquent or insolvent, then we shall be equitably paid for such additional services and expenses. All such changes shall be documented and approved in writing.

In the event suit or action is instituted to enforce this agreement or any terms hereof, or in the event of any appeal from suit, action or proceeding, the prevailing party shall be entitled to such sums as the court may adjudge reasonable as attorney's fees in such suit, action, or appeal.

This letter is written as a Professional Services Proposal and Agreement and an acceptance line is provided for your signature. Upon acceptance, please return one signed copy for our files.

This proposal, if not signed and returned within 60 days of the above date, will become invalid and must be renegotiated.

Sincerely,

MARQUESS & ASSOCIATES, INC.



Oscar J. Zuniga, P.E.

OJZ/me

Enclosures: Schedule of Fees
"Exhibit A", Marquess & Associates, Engineering Rate Schedule
"Exhibit B", Architectural Resources Group, Standard Billing Rates

AUTHORIZATION

Approved By _____ Date _____

City of Ashland Project No. 2020-15
 Ashland Community Center and Pioneer Hall Improvements
 Schedule of Fees - MAI Proposal No. P20-9211
 March 16, 2021

ASHLAND COMMUNITY CENTER				
Discipline	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Totals
	Preliminary Design & Engineering	Final Design & Engineering	Construction Management	
Architectural	\$23,080	\$35,100	\$24,590	\$82,770
Structural	\$5,120	\$17,895	\$5,335	\$28,350
Mech/Electrical	\$2,520	\$13,440	\$2,690	\$18,650
Cost Estimating	\$5,000	\$0	\$0	\$5,000
Totals	\$35,720	\$66,435	\$32,615	\$134,770

PIONEER HALL				
Discipline	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Totals
	Preliminary Design & Engineering	Final Design & Engineering	Construction Management	
Architectural	\$8,598	\$9,648	\$6,784	\$25,030
Structural	\$550	\$9,650	\$3,320	\$13,520
Mech/Electrical	\$900	\$7,650	\$2,300	\$10,850
Cost Estimating	\$1,000	\$0	\$0	\$1,000
Totals	\$11,048	\$26,948	\$12,404	\$50,400

NOTES:

1. Fees include estimated reimbursables for each phase and discipline.
2. The cost of printing hard-copy plan and specification sets is not included.
3. Fees do not include civil engineering.
4. *Architectural and engineering work, including scope, fees, and deliverables, are to be awarded and delivered separately and independently, and award of Phase 1 does not specifically guarantee award of Phases 2 or 3 to the same engineer/architectural, firm or team. If the City so chooses, the City may select a different consultant for subsequent phases through a separate formal selection process.*

